



UNIVERSITY OF NIŠ
The scientific journal **FACTA UNIVERSITATIS**
Series: **Philosophy and Sociology** Vol.2, № 7, 2000 pp. 325 - 336
Editor of series: *Glgorije Zaječaranović*
Address: Univerzitetski trg 2, 18000 Niš, YU
Tel: +381 18 547-095, Fax: +381 18 547-950

BOGOMILS, CATHARS, LOLLARDS AND THE HIGH SOCIAL POSITION OF WOMEN DURING THE MIDDLE AGES

UDC 316.35+316.66+396.1

Georgi Vasilev

Agency for Bulgarians Abroad, Sofia, e-mail: aba@bulgaria.net

Abstract. *The subject of this study is the special social and cultural status of woman obtained in the milieu of dualistic heresy. The Bogomilisme which appearance was at Xth century in Bulgaria allowed to women to preach in vernacular, to read the Holy scriptures, esp. the New Testament. That was practically an acces to the Word, to the creativeness. One can appreciate this unusual acquisition by the fact that in the Middle Ages in France, in all Western Europe it was forbidden to preach in native language - the Church services and sermons was practiced only in latin. In England such prohibitions were actual till XVIth sentury.*

The result of the innovation of the heretics was the rise of a unique protorenaissance culture in Provence /South France/, in which woman received special attention. The troubadours sang prise of woman, that was also the time of the frist poetesses /trobaritz/, precursors of the modern women poetry. In England women lollards are very active in the literary occupations of the lollardy.

The author applies a sociological approach to this situation of religious and cultural emancipation of woman. That is a possibility to outline more clearly the phenomenon of the self-realization of woman in the counter-culture of the dualist heresy carrying out some comparisons with some attitudes of the contemporary feminism.

Spring
...And all the flowers are resurrected
with the colors of Easter eggs.
Stefan Gechev

I. WOMEN'S EMANCIPATION AND THE BOGOMILS

During the 12th century, if not slightly earlier, Western Europe lived through a period of economic and social upheaval termed by many historians the 12th c. Renaissance. One of its aspects is related to the considerable emancipation of women mostly in Southern France, a development which spread over to Italy, Flanders, and later, England. One can even detect social zones where real emancipation was achieved. These were created in the socio-economic climate of the Cathar communities which espoused heretical dualist concepts. Similar developments can be observed among the Valdenses, who were genetically connected with the Cathars. It is important to remember that the dualist streak came from Bulgaria and cut through Bosnia, Dalmatia and Northern Italy. One of the most important characteristics of the Bulgarian dualists, Bogomils and Paulicians, was precisely the complete social liberation of women.

Bogomilism is generally well studied but still some new aspects arise and they need elucidation. As we know women achieved a high degree of emancipation in this movement. So it is interesting:

a) to explain this situation taking into consideration the theology and the social practice of the Bogomils;

b) to retrace how this new social status and activity of the woman was transmitted in Western Europe through the ways of the Bogomil and Cathar influence.

Here we shall try to consider why the Bulgarian heretics had a different conception of the woman and did not regard her as Adam's rib, nor a creature inferior to man, nor an object of material and sexual domination. This difference is explained by the central myth of the Bogomil heresy according to which the human soul was an angel placed within its clay wrapping of a body by scheming Satan himself. That is why the idea of spiritual growth among the Bogomils required a complete denial of this world, the secondary creation of Satan, as a way of returning to the heavenly realms of the Good Father /the Good God. Entering in a evolution of purification under the form of strictly ascetical life the adepts will take off their bodies if the bodies were clothes /stola/, and thus the soul will be freed in the moment of his apparent death. The body stays down on the earth becoming ashes not able to resurrect.

The Bogomil myth contains some remote echo about a bigger sin of the woman during the fall: women have incarnated the souls of the angels of second heaven/*angelo secundi coeli*/, while men have incorporated the souls of the angels of first heaven/*angelo primi coeli* [1]. But in sum, the basic aspiration of the Bogomils to abandon every thing of the material world/*omnia corporalia and visibilia* [2], created by the Satan /Lucifer/ and to get back in the realm of spiritual things/*omnia spiritualia et invisibilia* puts men and women in the same radical denial of the earthly existence.

This theologically motivated equality in the material life was supported by an equality in ritual - women had the right to be ordained and shrive. In a word, women had the right to be ordained and shrive a word, women had the right to become spiritual leaders which has always set on edge the Orthodox and Catholic clergy. Here is Prezviter Kozma's testimony: The heretics absolve themselves, though they are tied up with devilish fetters. This is done not only by the men but by the women also, which is worthy of castigation [3]. The asexual equality of men and women finds another expression: besides that women are admitted to the leaders role/traditionally occupied by men/ men can obtain the

birth capacity, that means the capacity to give birth of the word. Women and men could become Mothers of God/that is to say they all can give birth of the God's word the Logos. Dimitar Angelov, the well-known scholar of Bogomilism, has commented upon the remarkably high status of women [4]. By the way of example we should mention that sources tell of the heretics leader Irina of Thessaloniki who lived in the 15th [5]. For the sake of precision we do not intend to suggest that the genesis of the idea of women's equality is Bulgarian. The Bogomils did not create the idea but received it from the Manicheans through the Paulicianians. Yet, unlike the Manicheans, who kept their teaching secret, locked in small, closed elite groups, the Bogomils this position became a wide social practice, later to be handed down to the West. The civilizational aspect of this attitude can hardly be overestimated for women were not just introduced to the sacrament of the religious ritual but given access to working with "the Word" whereby achieving the full scope of culture. Their participation in a modern for this epoch literary activity, in the formation of the beginning of a humanistic approach in the culture and social behaviour is an undeniable fact in the Cathar civilization of Provence as well in the Lollard circles in England. Archimandrite Stefan Georgiev describes /his dissertation defended in Lausanne 1920/ the typical for the Bogomils collective discussion on sermons and apocrypha. The Bogomil longing for the depth of the literariness /as prezviter Kozma tries to ironize the heretics/ includes women without any restriction. The bishop-monks Leonce and Clement, sharing Bogomil convictions, were accused in Capadoce /1143/ during an official trial that they allow to women-heretics "to read the holy gospels and to serve mass together with Clement". In surplus these women were ordained for diaconess by the same Leonce and Clement /see the Appendix/.

This new reality caused in the long run changes both in the Orthodox and particularly in the Catholic tradition. These were for the first time brought into focus by Stefan Lazarov who writes that the Bogomils "even encouraged their enemies to think in a broader, more humane way in the sphere of art [6]. We shall quote a significant case that will be repeated over and over in our study. The changes that had occurred in the image of the Holy Virgin in the Orthodox and the Catholic interpretation were provoked by the Bogomil consideration of the woman.

A basic Bogomil tenet is that all souls could be saved, so there is no need of the Day of Judgement. This idea seriously invalidates the power of the Orthodox and Catholic Churches who promise an eternal fire to the disobedient persons. The clergy was obliged to introduce some degree of mitigation of the eternal punishment in order to prevent the growing up sympathy of some part of the flock towards the more merciful heretics. This portion of grace was inserted again through borrowing a topic of the heretical literary imagery. The Orthodox circles started to propagate and to use the apocryphal /may be better is to say the non canonical/ tale "The Descent of the Holy Virgin". This story as Moses Gaster and some others point out, is an imitation of the apocalyptic books that were in favor of the Bulgarian dualists, esp. "Visio Paoli" [7] In the same manner as apostle Paul descends in the hell to picture out the torments of the penitence/putting in bad places clergymen because the heretical criticism predicts such a fate for them, so Our Lady visits the lower world. Stirred by the pains of the sinners she asks her son - Jesus Christ to give them some rest from Green Thursday to Pentecost. It seems that reinforcement of the female principle in the officialized Christian myth was an answer, an adaptation of the Orthodox Church authorities towards the fact of real women

emancipation in the Bogomil spiritual and social life.

In this first, Bulgarian part of our article we can outline three factors, rooted in the practices of Bogomils, which testify to a new place of women in society:

- full participation in religious ritual,
- the right to engage in literary activities,
- a changed attitude of the official church regarding women, brought about by their emancipation in Bogomil communities.

The heresies which follow the Bulgarian heretical tradition keep these three factors in prominence and, in Southern France, new possibilities for cultural realisation were added.

II. THE WOMAN IN THE CATHARO-PROVENÇAL CIVILISATION

The place of women in Cathar communities in the South of France has been well studied. A few monographs deserve a special mention. Among them are the two volumes by Jean Guiraud [8] which pay considerable attention to Cathar women. G. Koch's monograph [9] (1962) has also been of great use to the present study. R. Nelli's book "*La vie quotidienne des Cathars au Languedoc au XIII^e siècle*", published in 1969 devotes an entire chapter to woman [10]. Le Roy Ladurie (1975) has also collected interesting empirical data about social life of woman under Cathar influence. In 1979 came out R. Abel's and Ellen Harrison's excellent article "The Participation of Women in Languedocian Heresy" [12] which is undoubtedly the best work in the field. One of the latest studies is Anne Brenon's "*Les Femmes cathares*" [13] (1992). As evident, the problem has been studied in depth, yet the empirical material lends itself to new interpretations.

Starting with Ms 609 and having considered other sources as well, R. Abel and E. Harrison give the following figures concerning the number of perfectae women: "the ratio between sightings perfecti and perfectae would still have been three to one" [14], and further, that "of 719 heretical ministers named in Ms 609, 318, or slightly less than 45% were women" [15]. The authors apply the term perfectae-class, which suggests the existence of a stably existing body of people. There is proof that the perfectae functioned among the women of the community and that, when there were no perfecti at hand the women had the right to give the consolamentum, the last unction, to male Cathars (See Dollinger, t. II, s. 165). Cathar women were the first to create charitable institutions which we find in medieval towns much later. Jean Guiraud describes their schools, boarding-houses, hospitals, workshops for poor women. Anne Brenon has correctly pointed out that these charitable and caring activities, typical of the Cathar communities in Languedoc at the beginning of the 13th c., began to grow in French towns only during the late Middle Ages [16].

Female Catharism had an institutional impact on the aristocracy. Guiraud speaks of the tradition among the lower and impoverished aristocracy to send their daughters, who were excluded from the inheritance of land, to Cathar pensions and boarding-houses so that they would be provided with a decent living. Abel and Harrison mention the same practice [17]. There is the curious example of Raimon IV (1194-1222), who in order to get rid of his second wife Beatrice, made her convert to Cathar asceticism. The same way Raimon-Roger de Foix "agrees" to let his wife part with him in order to follow the

secluded life of Cathar nuns [18]. This is an example of the permeation of Cathar precedent into law, which helped solve the problems raised by female inheritance which shows that Catharism was acceptable when it came to solving social problems. Cathar hostels, of the type of nunneries, were established at various places - in 1209 there were six of those in Montesquieu, in Saint-Martin-de-la Lande they were ten. Such institutions were ten. Such institutions were familiar in Le-Mas-Saintes-Puelles, Laurac, Vitrac, Villeneuve-la-Comptal and Cabaret [19].

The strongest historical memory of the participation of women in social life is born by Provençal culture. Le Roy Ladurie remarks on its integration and rationalisation on the level of everyday existence. It was open to "an exchange of ideas", "the women's word acquiring the same scope as the men's. There is "an insatiable aspiration in Occitan women to acquire and preserve their language" [20] As in contemporary feminism there is the attempt to overcome "the disempowerment through silence" and "to democratize access to the spoken and written word" [21].

The complete encounter between the woman and the word was achieved in the literature of Provence, and more precisely, in the amour courtois genre. There she is not a being subjected to man but an object of veneration. This does not mean that feudal attitudes had changed but that, in spite of all, an unheard of enhancement of the status of women was achieved, though mostly as a verbal gesture. The realities of life were as if compensated for in a symbolic literary gesture. After the *trouveres* had sung Roland's glory in the *chanson de geste* [22], the Provençal troubadours raised the lady of the heart to celestial heights. This aesthetic emancipation might also be interpreted as a projection of the equalising of the status of men and women among the Cathars. Scholars like Raul Manselli object against "any attempt to draw a parallel between Catharism and the amour courtois poetry" [23]. Yet, writers like Denis de Rougemont and Rene Nelli believe that such a link is legitimate, though they have not discovered all its complex convolutions and psychological motivation. A point which is important to remember is that most of the troubadours shared Cathar ideas. Pierre Cardenal's poems often read as dualist treatises and Pierre de Corbisan, though he wrote a "Prayer to the Virgin" in which he glorifies the mother of God, also believed that she had conceived through her ear, and that Christ had come out of her like a ray of light, without damaging her body [24]. These are traditional docetical views, typical of dualists, by way of which they deny Christ's material nature, identify him with the Word (the Logos), which every purified human being is capable of conceiving within himself. Bernard Sicart de Marvejols, like many other troubadours, levelled severe criticism against the Catholic church, the major enemy of the Cathars. That the amour courtois poetry was rather an act of the emancipation of the woman is suggested by the appearance of women poets (*trobaritz*) like La Comtesse de Die and Marie de Ventadour, who, in her poetic manifesto, declares "The Equality of Sexes in Love" (*L'egalite des sexes devant l'amour*) [25]. The development of women's poetry was stopped short in the 13th century as Pope Innocent and the French kings began a crusade against the Cathars in Southern France. As Alfred Jeanroy, a scholar of troubadour poetry has noted, these were hardly times favourable for the flourishing of a new literature for "the Inquisition had a firm grasp on all spiritual life" [26]. Now we shall try to consider the alternatives offered by the Catholic church to the emancipation achieved by Catharism. Unfortunately, the first of the measures taken was physical extermination - over one million people were destroyed. Mercy was not shown to women

as an act of exemplary punishment. The well-known Song of the Crusade against the Albigoisians ("La Chanson de la Croisade Albigeoise") tells of the woman ruler of the town of Lavaur - dame Guiraud, thrown on May 3rd, 1211 at the bottom of a well and there stone to death [27]. The author of La Canson Guillaume de Tudele, though in favour of the crusader's cause, cannot refrain from praising her goodness and generosity. Later came the time of more peaceful methods. Dominique d' Osma, the father of the Dominican Order, established Notre Dame de Prouilles, with the explicit intention to re-educate Cathar women from good families. This monastery was rather rich, as its documents clearly show, and had the support of the Vatican. But even then, according to R. Nelli, "women went on choosing the Order of Cathars, wherever it was, because it ensured their equality and made the oppressive nature of patriarchal power more bearable" [28]. The pro-Catholic literature about women was neither original nor attractive. The diversity has come again imitating the heretical letters. "Legenda Aurea" by Jacques de Voragine (a collection of lives created at the end of the 13th century). This book contains catholicised versions of some heretical apocrypha, including "The Tribulations of the Virgin" that is a reply of the Eastern Orthodox Church in its discussion with the dualists. There the Virgin begs the ireful Jesus Christ to have mercy upon sinful mankind. So he sends Dominique to begin the struggle for its salvation from the heresy [29]. Jean Guitton also has assumed that the rise of the cult of the Virgin is a reaction against "the mistakes" of the heretics, and was meant as a protection against the "dangerous degeneracy of the amour courtois poetry" (sic) [30]. In so far as the Virgin was represented as benign to sinners this broadened the zone of mercy and forgiveness in the Catholic world and allowed for milder relationships among human beings. The appearance of a system of nunneries in this period became a way of supplanting the shattered system of Cathar homes. They became the new centres of social care for women and their cultural affinities in spite of the limitations set upon them by the dogma. Having destroyed the cathar centres of women's social and cultural realization the Catholic Church had to create analogous formations.

III. LOLLARD WOMEN - OUTSTANDING PERSONALITIES

The generic links between the dualist Bogomil and Cathar heresy as well as that of the Lollards, which turns it into a pan - European phenomenon, have been discussed by us elsewhere [31]. So here we shall proceed with the details of our topic. The achievement of equality between men and women is best demonstrated by the permission granted lollard women to conduct services, as the Norwich trials testify. This has been declared in the testimonies of women at the trial. Hawisia Mone said: "Also that every man and every woman being in good lyf oute of synne is a good prest and hat (as) much poar of God in all thynges as ony prest ordered, be he pope or bisshop" [32]. A similar opinion statement was made by Sibilla, John Godsell's wife [33]. These, however, are not just opinions expressed by women. John Skylan, accused at the same trial, repeats the same words verbatim: "Also that every good man and good woman is a prest" [34]. Fifty one men and nine women were accused of heresy at that trial.

Yet, in some respects, the women were the more active part in it. Norman Tanner writes: "At least Margery Baxter and Hawisia Mone appear to have been active Lollards

and not mere followers of their husbands" [35]. N. Tanner correctly places John Burrell and Margery Baxter as major characters in the trial. The Inquisitor's notes from the interrogation of the latter clearly state that she developed heretical activities independently (*ipsa tenuit, credidit et affirmavit articulos sive opiniones subscriptas* - p. 42). Hawisia Moone also revealed her talent to dispute well. Matilde, wife of Richard Fletcher, was defined as a prominent heretic (*notata et multipliciter diffamata de heresi* - p. 131). Katerina Wryght, wife of Roger Wright, was described as *notatata et vehementer suspecta de crimine heretice pravitatis* - p. 194). Isabelle Chapleyn was also proclaimed a "well-known" heretic (*multipliciter notata* - p. 198).

The Lichfield and Coventry trials of 1511-12 provide similar data about the activity of women. Among the 45 persons put to trial one third were women. Again they were not just their husband's followers, but were rather among the leaders. John Gest confessed that he had been persuaded for eleven years by his wife Johanna to enter the heresy "*sirciter xi annos elapsos sollicitationibus Johanne, uxoris sue incidet in heresim*" [36]. Another woman, Alice Rowley, "appears to have been one of the busiest and most important working members of the 'sect' [37]. The most outstanding personality in the whole of the three-year process in Norwich was a woman. Margery Baxter transcends all the clichés of the dispute between the inquisitors and the heretics. We should not forget that the language both of the church and the heretics was strongly clichéd. The only one who freely spoke of her religion in an outburst of spontaneity was Margery Baxter. She was the one who told the Bogomilo-Cathar myth of the fall of Lucifer in her own rendition (p.49). The legend of the bee, which stings the tongue of traitors, suggests a possible acquaintance with "The Physiologus", another important literary and philosophic tract of the Middle Ages. By leaving the formulaic language of the dogma, she infused the trial with a most surprising metaphoric expression, or as a modern feminist might say, hers was "a self-articulation within the subculture" [38]. This is a good example of the link between liberal religion and literacy, typical of Lollard sub-culture, which, because of its greater openness can be regarded as the avant garde cultural zone of the times. As Malcolm Lambert has written, the latter included the variants of the Wyclifite Bible, which was translated into English, as well as other vernacular collections of the Lollard sermon-cycle, functioning of professional writing - offices, etc.. The cultural significance of the translation can hardly be overestimated, given "how strongly the ecclesiastical authorities held the view that it was the translations of the Scripture that were the cause and root of all trouble" [39]. This literary production was marked by academic quality and is a most important literary legacy of the period [40]. Documents again testify to the active role of women in this field. Alice Rowley confessed that she had used "good bookis" [41], while her husband was in the habit of reading to her "from St. Paul's Epistles" [42]. There are other records of such family readings in the Proceedings of the Norwich trials.

As authors like A. Lombard, M. Gaster, Yordan Ivanov, R. Abels and E. Harrison have underlined, the profusion of heretic literature becomes part of a rather wide and free literary context which is common for the heretics and the orthodox. In England this brings about a new understanding of women on the part of the official church - there appear nunneries and a vast body of literature addressed to women. Such are "Hali Maidhad", "Seinte Margarete", "Sawales Warde", "Ancrene Wisse", etc.. Two of them contain key-motifs from the basic dualistic myths, disseminated by Bogomils, Cathars, and Lollards. In their introduction to the collection "Medieval English Prose for Women" the editors

Bella Millet and Jocelyn Wogan-Browne re-construct this topic from "Hali Meidhad", without suggesting its heretical roots: "Had man been content to replace the angels in God's creation and not to imitate Lucifer's disobedience, our nature could and should have been like that of the angels." [43] This is a repetition of the myth about Lucifer's rebellion and fall, told by Margery Baxter but already coming from the pages of the official religious literature. Another visible dualist quotation in "Sawles Warde" is the descent into Hell and the ascent in Heaven [44]. This is a variant of "Visio Paoli" and "Nicodemus Gospel", apocalyptic writings distributed by the heretics. This characteristic free compilation and reproduction is also visible in "Seinte Margrete", which contains borrowings from the popular eastern apocrypha about the virgin Juliana. It is noteworthy to add that the fourth text "Guide for anchoresses" also comprises a sway of heterodoxy. First, one can disclose here some essential and stylistic reminiscences of the widespread in the Middle Ages "The Letter from Heaven" same "Legend of Sunday", or "Lord's Letter". It was a leading book of the Flagellants, bearing an Eastern provenance as Moses Gaster explains [45]. Second, Jesus is called Paraclete - an denomination, used basically by the Eastern dualists.

Two important features emerge. First, the two editors themselves point out that the context of this kind of lives is the debate with the heresies and the Islamic conquest. On the other hand we shall mention that the Catholic church used such compilations to create its own popular literature in its struggle against the Cathars. It is worth to remember the case of Jacques le Voragine's "Legenda Aurea", a book created at the end of the XIIIth century. It compiles many apocrypha that had undergone a procatholic wording. In sum, this enhanced interest in women in medieval England was a reflexion of the dynamics of the Renaissance of the 12th century. The editors of "Medieval English Prose for Women" have avoided the temptation of branding the development with "Englishness" and see this as an expression "not only of the literary tradition but of the French courtly literature and the Latin prose of the twelfth century Renaissance" [46]. The authors prefer the formula "transmitter or transformer" (we shall say both), and pay attention to the element of Jewish and Eastern apocrypha [47]. It remains for us to narrow the focus to a clearer picture as M. Gaster, I. Franko and D. Obolensky have already done, by specifying the heretical character of these apocrypha. Millet and Wogan-Brown have hinted upon this by seeing in "Hali Meidhad" an apparent closeness to heterodoxy [48].

A few rather clear conclusions can be drawn at the end of this short paper: First, that that Bogomils and Cathars, as well as the heresies close to them, were a powerful, even a main stream in the twelfth century Renaissance in the way they placed women in an equal position. On their part, the cultural activities of women brought about more mildness, mercy, elegance, psychological depth, a deeper interest in literature. Mores and behaviour become milder, to be elegant in manners was a fact of prestige. We can trust to the observation of Alfred Jeanroy that while in Southern France the troubadours created an unheard of spectrum of literary genres, in the North which was less affected by the heresy, the amour courtois was unknown, and the poetry of the trouveres was rather schematic, bearing testimony of the pride of the aristocracy in the recounting of the glories of battles. One fact more: the ladies' attention towards the troubadours and the jongleurs created the situation of "open society" - the poets and the singers were accepted in the feudal circles as equals. This emancipation of the art obtained through the woman emancipation of the art obtained through the woman emancipation is a high degree of early

democratization.

The epic poem was the only flowering genre about 1160. The literary richness of the forms, this blossoming forth in the South of France according to Alfred Jeanroy had been a result of the situation in which women imposed their more cultivated taste [49]. The leading role of Provençal literature was admitted by Dante and Petrarch who saw themselves as its followers [50]. In England after the suppression of John Ball's rebellion the dualist heresy lost the ground for free development but created social groups which brought about a peak in the literature of the period. As the proceedings of the Norwich trials clearly show, the women were natural leaders in this literary revival. So the Bogomil-Cathar emancipation of the woman asserts itself to be a spiritual component of the XIIth century Renaissance helping the rise of provisional cultural model - a forerunner of the modern civilization.

REFERENCES

1. Interrogatio Joannis - in Й. Иванов, *Богомилски книги и легенди*, С., 1925, с.78
2. Fr. Racki, Prilozi za povest bosanskih patarena - in *Starine* 1869/1, p. 138
3. Презвитер Козма - *Беседа против богомилите* - in "Стара българска литература /2/. Ораторска проза", С., 1982, с.54
4. Д. Ангелов, *Богомилството*, С., 1993, с. 257.
5. *Пространно житие на Теодисий Търновски от патриарх Калист* в "Стара българска литература /4/. Животописни творби", С., 1986, с. - с. 452-453.
6. Ст. Лазаров, *Проучвания върху културата на богомили и катарите: театър, музика /Автореферат на дисертация/, С., 1989, с.4.*
7. M. Gaster: "The Descent to Hell" itself gave rise to a remarkable imitation, "The Descent of the Holy Virgin", and it is easily to imagine the influence it would have on the popular fancy, especially as it was from the beginning regarded as the clue to the mysterious life after death, and therefore gave an opportunity of entering into all possible torments, while the original Gospel only spoke of a place of wailing and gnashing of teeth. " - Ilchester Lectures on Greco-Slavonic Literature and its Relation to the Folk-lore of Europe During the Middle Ages, London., 1887, p. 52. One has to pay attention to a theological subtlety. The anonymous author of the "The Descent of the Holy Virgin" has his way to discuss with the dualists: he puts them in the inferno because they refused to preach the name of Our Lady, as well they negated the material nature of the Christ's body. This detail reveals "The Descent of the Holy Virgine" as a remake-reply against the Bogomils.
8. J. Guiraud, *Cartulaire de Notre-Dame de Prouilles, precede d'une etude sur l'Albigisme languedocien au XIIe et XIIIe siecles*, t. 1-2, Paris, 1907.
9. G. Koch, *Frauenfrage und Ketzertum im Mittelalter/Forshungen zur mittelalterlichen Geschichte* 9; Berlin, 1962.
10. R. Nelli, *La vie quotidienne des Cathares du Languedoc au XIIe siecle*, Paris, 1969.
11. Le Roy Ladurie, *Montaillou, village occitan de 1294 a 1324*, Paris, 1975/1982.
12. R. Abels and E. Harrisson, *The Participation of Women in the Languedocien Catharism - in Medieval Studies*, t. 41, Toronto.
13. A. Brenon, *Les Femmes cathares*, Paris, 1992.
14. R. Abels and E. Harrisson, op. cit., p. 226.
15. Ibidem, p. 225.
16. A. Brenon, op. cit., p. 210. A. Brenon as Guiraudid before her enumerates the cathar institutions: hospital/asylin, craftsman's workshop, shelter - p. 215.
17. R. Abels and E. Harrisson, op. cit., p.217: "Because of poverty, the minor nobility turned to the heretical convents to place their unmarried daughters and widow female relations". The authors mention also the education role of such establishments: "Cathar convents occasionally functionned as seminaries for daughters of the rural nobility". - p. 232.
18. R. Nelli, op. cit., p. - p. 106-107.
19. R. Ables and E. Harrisson, op. cit., p.-p. 228-229.

20. Le Roy Ladurie, op. cit., p. - p.383-385.
21. E. Long, *Feminism and Cultural Studies* - in *Critical perspectives on media and society*, New York-London, 1991, p. 117.
22. The troubadours knew well the name of Roland. See Peire Vidal of Toulouse, who says: "My audacity is equal in this of Roland and Olivier, while in the art of love I am equal to Berart de Mondesdidier' sqart of love..." - in J. Roubaud, *Les Troubadours /anthologie bilingue/*, Paris, 1971, p. 220. But in the troubadour's poetry the image of Roland was displaced by the admiration towards the beloved lady.
23. R. Manselli, *Dolore e morte nella esperienza religiosa catara* - in Todi, Presso di l'Academia Tudertina, 1967, p. 258.
24. Peire de Corbian, Prière à la Vierge - in *Anthologie des troubadours XIIe-XIIIe siecles/edition refondue/*, Paris, 1974, p. 367. Peire de Corbian shares practically the sam heretical vue that is criticized in the "Descent of the Holy Virgin". See note 7.
25. Ibidem, p. 198. J. Roubaud in his anthology "*Les troubadours*" quotes the names of some other women poets like Azalais de Porcraignes, Na Castelloza, Clara d'Anduse, Bieiris de Romans plus one anonimous poetess.
26. A. Jeanroy, Introduction in "*Anthologie des troubadours*", p. 29.
27. Guillaume de Tudele, *La chanson de la Croisade Albigeoise /Cansos de la Crozada/*, editee e traduite par Eugene Martin-Chabot, Paris, 1976, v.5. p.165
28. R. Nelli, op. cit., 108
29. Jacques de Voragine, *La Légende dorée - traduite de latin par T. de Wyzewa*, Paris, 1920, p. 402-403
30. J. Guittou, *Le Christ équartelé/crises et conciles dans l'église/*, Paris, 1963, p. 196.
31. See G. Vassilev, Bogomisl and Lollards. *Dualistic motives in England during the Middle Ages* - in *Etudes Balkaniques*, 1/1993
32. *Heresy trials in the dioces of Norwich 1428-31*, edited by Norman P. Tanner, London., 1977, p. 142.
33. Ibidem, p. 67
34. Ibidem, p. 147.
35. Ibidem, p. 26
36. J. Fines, *Heresy trials in the diocese of Coventry and Lichifield*, 1511-12 - in *Journal of Ecclesiastical Hisroty*, vol. 14, 1963, p.p. 161-162.
37. Ibidem, p. 162
38. E. Long, op. cit., p. 120
39. J. Fines, op. cit., p. 165 /These words seem to be an euphemism when Jonh Foxe gives the information that in 1542 Thomas Bernard and Javes Morden were burned because "the one teaching the Lord's Prayer in English, and the other for keeping the Epistle of St. Javes translated into English."-see W.H. Summers, *The Lollards of the Chiltern Hills*, London, 1906, p. 97.
40. M. Lambert, *Medieval heresy*, 1977/1992, Oxford, p. 249
41. J. Fines, op. cit., p. 162.
42. Ibidem, p. 166.
43. *Medieval English Prose for Women*, ed. by B. Millet and J. Wogan-Browne, Oxford, 1990, p.XV.
44. A precise quotation is more expressive here:"... we should look from the vision of hell to the joy of heaven, feel fear from the one, love towards the other...", ibidem., p. 109. The text also includes three allegories of the type used in "Le Roman de la Rose" and that is an indication of an influence of the French medieval literature. Fear relates about inferno whereas Reason, helped by Prudence and Fortitude in God describes the paradise.
45. M. Gaster /op.cit., p. 67/ explains the way the apocrypha reached Anglia: "Roger of Hovedene gives this "Letter from Heaven in his Cronicle under the year 1201 and says that it had been brought in this to England by Abbot Eustachiys of Flays. The letter was directly copied thence by Roger of Wendower into his own Chronicle. An Anglo-Saxon translation is said to be in existence at Corpus ChristiCollege in Oxford".
46. Ibidem, p. XIV
47. Ibidem, p. XXIII
48. Ibidem, p. XVI
49. A. Jeanroy, op. cit. , p. 16.
50. See for exemple J. A. Cuddon, *Dictionary of literary terms and literary theory*, London, 1977/1991, p.p. 1007-1008: "The troubadours /Who composed in langue d'oc/ had a very considerable influence on Dante and Petrarch, and indeed on the whole development of the lyric /q.v./, especially love lyric in Europe".

APPENDIX

THE RIGHT OF WOMEN TO ORDAIN AND TO SHRIVE ACCORDING
TO THE PRACTICE OF BOGOMILS, CATHARS AND LOLLARDS**1. Bogomils**

X-th century

Prezviter Kozma's testimony in his "Tract against the Bogomils" : "The heretics absolve themselves, though they are tied up with devilish fetters. This is done not only by men but by the women also, which of castigation".

XII /1143/

"...he ordained women for diaconesses letting them to read prayers and the saint Gospels, and to serve mass along with Clement."

καὶ χειροτονῆσαι γυναῖκας διακονίσσας
καὶ ἐπιτρέπειν αὐταῖς τὰς συνήθεις ἐκκλησιαστικὰς αἰτήσεις
πρὸς τὸ καὶ τὴν ἀγίων εὐαγγελίων ἀναγνῶσθαι καὶ
σὺλλειτουργῆσαι ταύτας μετὰ τοῦ κλημέντος.

2. Cathars

At the beginning of the XIV-th century

Depositions of R.V. for the Inquisition in Languedoc, describing how cathar women can practice the "Consolamentum", the sacrament of the Cathars: "...that this power from the hands of the good men upon the good men, and from the hands of the good women upon the good women...that the good women posses the mentioned power and they can receive it for exercising on men and women, and as so it is that good men are absent /the adepts/ can be saved by good women, the same way as good men do.

3. Lollards...

Note:

Only 563 years after the trial of Norwich /when it was proved that the heretics gave to the woman the right to shrive/ the Anglican Church, unique of the Christian Churches ordained in march 1994 32 women for priests. We can disclose here a long distant, oblique influence of the tradition of the English heretics. In maintenance of such a supposition is the fact that in its centuries-old discussion with the Vatican the Church of England was using almost the same critical qualifications and epithets as the heretics did.

The rigid position of the Catholic Church against the women-priest was corroborated by John-Paul II at 27 of July, 1994. He explained that as far Jesus had chosen for apostols only men, there no reasons to change the situation today. According to Reuter, the source of this information, this definite refusal would be hardly revoked by the next popes.

BOGOMILI, KATARI, LOLARDI I VISOKI DRUŠTVENI POLOŽAJ ŽENE U SREDNJEM VEKU

Georgi Vasilev

Predmet ove studije je posebni društveni i kulturni status žene ostvaren u miljeu dualističke jeresi. Bogomilstvo koje se u Bugarskoj javlja u 10. veku omogućilo je ženama da propovedaju na kolokvijalnom jeziku, da čitaju Sveto pismo, naročito Novi zavet. Bio je to, praktično, prodor u svet Reči, svet kreativnosti. O ovoj neobičnoj novini se može suditi na osnovu činjenice da je u srednjem veku u Francuskoj, kao uostalom i u celoj zapadnoj Evropi, bilo zabranjeno držati propovedi na narodnom jeziku - crkvena služba i propovedi su bili na latinskom jeziku. Takve zabrane su u Engleskoj bile aktuelne sve do 16. veka.

Rezultat inovacije jeretika bila je pojava jedinstvene protorenesansne kulture u Provansi (južna Francuska) u kojoj se ženi posvećivala posebna pažnja. Trubaduri su pevali hvalospeve o ženi, a bilo je to i vreme prvih pesnikinja, preteča moderne ženske poezije. U Engleskoj su veoma aktivne žene lolardi koje se okušavaju u književnim formama lolardije.

Autor primenjuje sociološki pristup na ovu situaciju religiozne i kulturne emancipacije žene. To je prilika da se jasnije rasvetli fenomen samoostvarenja žene u kontra-kulturi dualističke jeresi na bazi poređenja sa nekim stavovima savremenog feminizma.