

**PURE OR HYBRID?
THE DEVELOPMENT OF MIXED DICTIONARY GENRES**

UDC 81'374

Reinhard R. K. Hartmann

University of Exeter, University of Birmingham

Email: r.r.k.hartmann@exeter.ac.uk

Abstract. *This paper explores 'hybrid' genres of dictionaries and other reference works. Against the tradition of general dictionaries becoming ever more specialised, there has also been a growing trend of mixing two or more 'pure' dictionary types for achieving specific purposes, e.g. the combination of alphabetic and thematic dictionary, general dictionary and technical glossary, dictionary and thesaurus, dictionary and encyclopedia, monolingual and bilingual dictionary, etc. Examples of these various sub-types are discussed (admitting that dictionary research has neglected their study), with the aim of determining overall trends and implications, particularly with regard to the possibility of their further development with the means of information technology.*

Key words: *Lexicography, dictionary history, dictionary typology, dictionary criticism, dictionary structure, dictionary use, hybrid genres, (electronic) reference works*

"Purity is obscurity." (Ogden Nash, 1959)

1. INTRODUCTION

I was puzzled, as part of my recent experience as a member of the University choir singing one of Joseph Haydn's masses, composed in 1799 and entitled (in English) *Maria Theresa Mass*. With my Austrian background, I queried this title, which in all German-language publications I know is called *Theresienmesse*, based on *Maria Theresia*. However, the English form of this name is usually given as *Maria* (or *Marie*) *Theresa*. Where does this come from, why was the mass dedicated to her in the first place, and which kind of reference work would be most appropriate for checking the facts? Is this information included in any general dictionary, or do I have to consult a more specialised reference book such as a biographical encyclopedia? Or are there perhaps compromise types that contain both general words and historical names?

A partial solution may actually come from the field of music: there are many mixed genres, such as 'crossover' (gospel and pop), 'fusion' (jazz and rock), and various folk traditions, often themselves of a mongrel nature and collectively known nowadays as 'world music' (ethnic/indigenous rather than Western/international), such as Argentinean tango, Andalusian flamenco and Serbian kolo. All this is, of course, reminiscent of what in linguistics would be called 'creolisation' (and in gardening 'cross-breeding'). So perhaps I should look for a hybrid dictionary covering both general words and relevant facts from music and history?

Starting from this dilemma, I attempt in this paper¹ to explore some of the issues in distinguishing the many kinds of multi-purpose reference works available today, and their potential for future development.

2. GENERAL OR SPECIALISED?

The most obvious dichotomy seems to be between the 'general-purpose' dictionary and the 'specialised' dictionary, the former usually with a strong emphasis on the general lexicon and the latter devoted to more limited knowledge. In many lexicographic traditions with which I am familiar, there is a discernible gradual development from the general dictionary – in the form of a glossed and indexed word-list -- to specialised reference works which include more and more detailed information types. The index that allows access to the required information is either based on the writing system of the respective language (typically the alphabetic order) or on a topical system of knowledge (thematic order), sometimes in combination.

In most cultures, dictionaries initially focus on general vocabulary items (English words like *guitar*), sometimes in contrast to 'hard words', such as *bandora* or *mandolin*, and other related members of the lexical family of plucked string instruments ('archaisms' like *gittern* and *lyre*, 'regionalisms' like *banjo* and *ukulele*, 'foreignisms' like *sitar* or *kora*, 'neologisms' like *electric guitar* and *bass guitar*, and 'technicisms' like *slide guitar* or *stratocaster*). Gradually, other information categories are added to the general dictionary, such as spelling (orthographic conventions), pronunciation (phonetic transcriptions), grammar (coded word classes), meaning (definitions or translation equivalents), etymology (historical details), onomastic information (personal and place names), encyclopedic information, etc. At the same time, specialised or 'segmental' dictionaries have also evolved for each of these separate information types, e.g. pronunciation dictionaries, etymological dictionaries, dialect dictionaries, synonym dictionaries, dictionaries of idioms, dictionaries of names, etc. Recent developments in electronic lexicography have made it possible to combine all these various products; indeed, most computer word-processing systems nowadays automatically include both a spelling dictionary and a thesaurus!

There are also more technical reference works (sometimes referred to, e.g. by Herbert Ernst Wiegand [1998], as 'non-lexicographic' types), such as almanacs, atlases, bibliographies, calendars, catalogues, chronologies, companions, directories, handbooks, manuals, phone-books, ready reckoners, subject guides, time-tables, who's who's, etc. The problem

¹ I acknowledge with thanks the help and comments received from Lynn Hartmann and Kay Morris (both on art and gardening), Steve Martin (on music), Tim Rickwood (on computer scanning), Helen Wells (on meteorology) as well as Violeta Stojičić, Shigeru Yamada, Kaoru Akasu, Gregory James and Young-kuk Jeong.

is that it is very hard to draw a definite boundary line between lexicographic and non-lexicographic types of reference works, and they often seem to be available in unpredictable formats; hence Henri Béjoint's resigned remark (1994: 37) that "(d)ictionaries come in more varieties than can ever be classified in a simple taxonomy." One way out of this quandary would be an overarching 'reference science' as proposed by Tom McArthur (1998) which might provide a better practical and theoretical framework for evaluating the various genres, under three headings: (a) *lexicography*, for all kinds of dictionaries, (b) *encyclopedics*, for encyclopedias, atlases, gazetteers, almanacs and manuals, and (c) a third branch (which does not yet have an established subject field title) for other reference works such as tabulations, directories and catalogues, including electronic versions of all of these.

3. PURE OR HYBRID?

New dictionary genres which are the result of 'hybridisation', referred to variously as mixed, combined, compromise, blended, or mongrel types, are appearing all the time, presumably to meet a latent demand for them. In the *DL* (Hartmann & James 1998: 69), the following definition is provided for *hybrid*:

"The combination of one or more types of REFERENCE WORK in a single product. Often there are no distinct designations for these compromise genres, which include 'dictionary-cum-atlas', 'dictionary-cum-encyclopedia', 'dictionary-cum-grammar', 'dictionary-cum-thesaurus', 'dictionary-cum-usage guide', and 'monolingual-cum-bilingual dictionary'. ..."

What this characterisation does not make explicit is the deplorable fact that in the literature on dictionaries, these hybrid genres have received very limited attention. The general textbooks on lexicography are remarkably silent on them, although they occasionally admit the long-established practice of including specialised information, such as slang, technical terms and names, in many of our general-language dictionaries (Svensén 1993/2004, Landau 1984/2001). The situation is only marginally better within the main branches of dictionary research.

Thus, in **dictionary history**, Tom McArthur (1986: 109) explicitly recognises the mutual relations between the dictionary and the encyclopedia, stressing the fact that "... the two great genres of educational reference have been intertwined throughout their histories, and that in countries like France and the United States such hybrids as encyclopedic dictionaries have been produced for years and will go on being produced." Alluding to the sub-title of McArthur's book, Bill Katz (1998) offers a history of multifarious reference works from the perspective of library science. He not only confirms the frequent combination of encyclopedic and dictionary information, but provides a fascinating survey of such 'reference sources' as chronicles, manuals, maps, biographies, bibliographies and government documents.

In the specialism usually referred to as **dictionary typology**, an effort is made to classify this variety of dictionaries and other reference works that we find in the world into clearly delineated types or genres. An early pioneer in this field was the Russian linguist Lev V. Shcherba (1940) whose classification was based on six abstract dichotomies based on content, arrangement, language and approach which he intended to elaborate in

later studies (but never did). Shcherba's query whether 'pure' dictionary types actually exist becomes a practical issue when metalexigraphers start to seriously examine specific exemplars. Thus, Noel Osselton (2000/2003: 109) uses the term 'hybrid' for the *Oxford English Dictionary* compiled by James Murray et al. and the historical dictionaries compiled by the Grimm brothers, Emile Littré and Matthias de Vries, as they "combine two functions: (1) to provide a full description of the vocabulary of their own day – words in use, their meanings, their status, pronunciation, and so on; but (2) at the same time to order and present all kinds of information about its past."

Other combined genres have rarely received this kind of scholarly attention. The trend towards encyclopedic dictionaries as diagnosed by McArthur is examined in a comparative history of the 'popular encyclopedia' in 19th-century Germany and Great Britain by Ulrike Spree (2000), but although several cases such as the *Brockhaus-Conversations-Lexikon* and the *Encyclopaedia Britannica* are explored, the range and nature of sub-genres from the multi-volume encyclopaedia to the one-volume (*Universal-*)*Lexikon* is not always clearly laid out against the background of the historical development of encyclopedias and that of the French *Encyclopédie* in particular (cf. Collison 1964, Kafker 1981). Thus both the history and the typology of mixed-genre dictionaries remain a desideratum (more on specific hybrid genres below).

It should be the task of **dictionary criticism** to verify the content(s) and function(s) of particular dictionary types. Although this has been attempted for certain individual products, and some criteria for assessing these have been proposed (such as Roger Steiner's 'guidelines' for reviewing bilingual dictionaries [1984], or Herbert Ernst Wiegand's commissioned collective critiques of two dictionaries of German for foreign learners [1998, 2002]), there are very few attempts at assessing the purpose and quality of hybrid genres. One interesting set of papers from a conference in Australia (McCalman 1996) considers the case for a critical approach to the 'biographical dictionary' such as the (*New Oxford*) *Dictionary of National Biography*, but without agreeing on an agenda for establishing the minimal requirements of such ventures in future.

Dictionary structure is the branch of dictionary research in which two important questions are investigated: (i) which information categories should be selected for treatment in a reference work? and (ii) how should they be presented for the benefit of those seeking this information? Many years ago, the American linguist Mary Haas (1962) discussed such desiderata from the point of view of bilingual dictionaries; her list is still relevant today, as it includes, inter alia, translation equivalent(s) for each word or expression, grammatical information, usage levels, names of personages past and present, place names, names of famous books and plays, names of characters therein, specialised vocabulary items of all the sciences, professions, manufacturing industries and trades, information about correct spellings, information needed to instruct the user in the proper way to pronounce each word, etc.

But in addition to the double issue of how to arrange and index the selected information in a sensible list (macrostructure) and how to treat it inside meaningful entries (microstructure), there are other elements that are important for the successful production and use of a reference work, such as the totality of the wordlist together with any 'outside matter' (megastructure), their consultation via search guides (access structure) and cross-references (mediostucture), and the relative attention paid to linguistic-lexical and encyclopedic-technical information (distribution structure). All these are bound to be more complex in new hybrids rather than in conventional pure dictionary formats, particularly

if features such as pictorial illustrations, film and sound have to be added, or special pedagogical and legal requirements have to be incorporated for certain user groups. Experimenting with such structural components can benefit our better understanding of the underlying principles and potential innovation, but one risk of packing more and more mixed details into the dictionary may be information overload for the potential user, as illustrated by the kind of text compression that is typical of entries (like **hybrid**) in such dictionaries as the 2-volume *NSOED* (1993: 1285):

hybrid /'haɪbrɪd/ *n.* & *a.* E17. [L. *hybrida*, (*h*)*ibrida*.] *A n.* 1 An animal or plant that is the offspring of individuals of different kinds (usually, different species). E17. 2 A person of mixed descent or mixed ancestry. Now usu. *derog.* M17. 3 A thing derived from heterogeneous sources or composed of incongruous elements; *Philol.* a word formed of elements from different languages; *Geol.* a hybrid rock. M19.
 1 ANTHONY HUXLEY Showy man-made hybrids seen in florists' shops. 3 R. F. HOBSON A psychotherapist is a kind of hybrid . . . : a quasi-scientist, a quasi-artist.
B adj. 1 Of mixed character, heterogeneous; derived from unlike sources; (of a parliamentary bill) treated in some respects as a public bill and in others as a private one; (of a computer) employing both digital and analogue methods; (of rock) formed by the mixing of two magmas, or by the incorporation of solid rock into magma. E18. 2 Bred or produced as a hybrid. L18.
Special collocations: **hybrid perpetual** any rose of a group of formerly popular garden hybrids, derived in part from the Bourbon rose. **hybrid swarm** *Ecol.* a variable population resulting from the hybridization of neighbouring species. **hybrid tea** any rose of a group of hybrids now much grown, evolved from crosses between hybrid perpetuals and the tea-rose, *Rosa* × *adorata*. **hybrid vigour** = HETEROSIS 2.
hybridism *n.* (a) the fact or condition of being hybrid; (b) the production of hybrids: M19. **hybridist** *n.* a hybridizer M19. **hy'bridity** = HYBRIDISM (a) M19.

The ultimate criterion for meeting a society's reference needs is successful **dictionary use**. The user perspective has indeed been the subject of detailed studies for the last two or three decades. However, work on the use of mixed dictionary types has been extremely limited. One exception to this has been Martin Stark (1999) who described a relatively new lexicographic hybrid, the encyclopedic learner's dictionary, and found that works such as the *LDEL*C, the result of 'cross-breeding' of two other hybrids (the encyclopedic dictionary and the learner's dictionary), need more attention, both in terms of the factual information they offer and of the difficulties associated with their use.

The final branch of dictionary research is **dictionary IT**, or the way computers can assist us in compiling and consulting better reference works. Ever since Steven Dodd (1989: 91) asserted that "(a) computer database is almost infinitely extensible, and so there is more scope for the inclusion of extra material on any item", the use of information technology has been overwhelming, both as a means of obtaining information worldwide (there were 605 hits resulting from my Wanadoo-Google web-search for *Haydn* + *Theresienmesse*, and 48,762 for *hybrid* + *dictionary*, although I did not have the time to pursue them) and as a tool for making electronic reference works available to an ever greater range of users. As Yukio Tono (2004) has demonstrated, there is not only a multiplicity of formats (CD-ROM, Hyperlink, Pop-up mode, Parallel format, and Pocket e-dictionary), but also many combinations of dictionaries (such as hand-held calculator dictionaries for language learners) whose usefulness has yet to be tested.

4. SOME SPECIFIC EXEMPLARS

I present here a list of about two dozen hybrid dictionaries, based largely on those available to me at home, but there is only room in this paper for one example of each subtype. I try to give an impression of the whole range, good and bad, old and new, large and

small, common and rare, hardback and paperback. Disappointingly, fewer than 10% of these are mentioned in the bibliography *DDEE* (Kabdebo & Armstrong 1997), paradoxical for a reference work that is itself a hybrid, priding itself of covering over 8,000 "dictionaries, encyclopedias and other selected wordbooks in English".

(1) **Dictionary cum etymology**

As Noel Osselton (2000) has pointed out, 'historical' dictionaries like the *OED* and its derivatives, such as the so-called 'period dictionaries' for the various stages in the development of the language, have been prototypically hybrid products. But there are other sub-types, such as the rather original *FHRE*, a 384-page account of the derivation of English words from Indo-European and non-Indo-European languages, with (a) an introduction, (b) six sections listing word roots from various language families in alphabetical order, plus three appendices: (c) language groups, (d) known and unknown roots, based on reconstructed forms in Julius Pokorny's *IEW* (1959-69), and (e) bibliographical references.

(2) **Dictionary cum textbook**

As we have seen above, Martin Stark (1999) was one of the first to state explicitly that pedagogical dictionaries for foreign learners of English are combinations of ordinary dictionaries with 'principles and practice of foreign language teaching'. *MEDAL* is such a product, a 1,692-page book firmly in the tradition of the famous British EFL dictionaries, but with several impressive innovations: (a) the front-matter includes a foreword by a senior advisor, an introduction by the editor-in-chief, and a user-friendly set of instructions; (b) the middle-matter, interspersed in the alphabetical wordlist, has colour illustrations (e.g. for house, clothes and transport) and panels on language awareness (topics such as phrasal verbs, academic writing, and word formation), and (c) the back-matter contains the dictionary's defining vocabulary of 2,500 words, a list of usage labels, and a pronunciation guide. The entries themselves are strengthened by information on frequency rates, sense-discrimination menus, usage labelling (e.g. British vs. American English), pictorial illustrations, sentence examples, and collocational information. (On encyclopedic learners' dictionaries, see No. 14; on electronic dictionaries, see No. 21 below.)

(3) **Monolingual cum interlingual dictionary**

Known variously as bilingualised dictionary, semi-bilingual dictionary, or bridge dictionary in the context of English learner lexicography (such products based on A.S. Hornby's dictionaries are examined by Carla Marengo [1998] and Tom McArthur [2005]), but as Gregory James (1994) has reminded us, translations of English dictionaries have been around for centuries. The *LLCE*, a Chinese adaptation of the *Longman Lexicon*, is a 1,289-page learner's thesaurus, with Chinese translation equivalents of the thematically grouped synonyms and examples, supported by pictorial illustrations, plus an English index. Special-purpose technical, encyclopedic and terminological dictionaries (see Nos. 6, 13 and 19 below) are also often subjected to translation, which is what happened when the *DL* was published in a Japanese version in 2003.

(4) **Dictionary cum grammar**

The 314-page *WPGSSD* is part of the Trident mini dictionary library (see also under Nos. 5 and 22 below) whose author and original publication details are not acknowl-

edged, but which offers a 'complete guide' in seven largely discursive sections devoted to (a) types of unspoken communication, (b) forms of spoken communication, (c) tools for effective written communication (including grammatical information such as *Wrong*: Mary took John to be I. *Right*: Mary took John to be me.), (d) writing academic assignments, essential letters and résumés (CVs), (e) an alphabetical list of foreign words and phrases, (f) proof-reader's marks and (g) a general index.²

(5) Dictionary cum usage guide

The *WPGSSD* is relevant also under this heading as it targets effective composition, although in the terms of the classical critique of 10 usage guides and 10 dictionaries by Thomas Creswell (1975) it is rather limited, vague and prescriptive. By contrast, the *VWBD*, a 954-page dictionary of German regionalisms (sub-titled *Die Standardsprache in Österreich, der Schweiz und Deutschland sowie in Liechtenstein, Luxemburg, Ostbelgien und Südtirol*) offers a comprehensive sociolinguistic documentation of cultural vocabulary from the various German-speaking territories in Central Europe. In a typical entry in the A-Z part, e.g. under *Matura*, there are regional labels (A for Austria, CH for Switzerland), grammatical details (no plural), alternatives (*Reifeprüfung* A D, *Matur* CH, *Abitur* D), definitions (>Prüfung bzw. Schulabschluss zur Erlangung der Hochschulreife<), corpus-based examples (*Thomas hätte im letzten Herbst die Matura bestanden, wolle aber nicht an die Hochschule*. Hostetter, Moira 10; CH), and cross-references (*Berufsmatura*, *HAK-Matura*, *Maturaball*, *maturieren* etc.). Regional variations of names, such as *Mitzi* for *Maria*, are also listed. The front-matter includes (a) a preface, (b) instructions for use, (c) contents of entries, (d) a definition of 'national' centres of German, (e) regional features of Standard German; the back-matter includes (f) a list of the text corpus and (g) bibliographical references.

(6) Dictionary cum subject guide

Most subject fields have their own dictionaries (sometimes called LSP dictionaries, short for 'languages for specific purposes'). Gardening experts have shown me several such hybrid guides, for identifying specific plants, for placing and treating specific plants, for locating plants in specific garden centres, and even for checking the pronunciation and etymology of specific plant names. What I have selected for exemplification here is *EL*, a 505-page guide to the 46 countries within and outside the European Union, in three sections: (a) survey articles on various historical, cultural, political and legal aspects of European integration, (b) details on individual countries, grouped under seven geographical regions, and (c) brief articles on European institutions grouped alphabetically, plus an appendix of chronological and bibliographical data and websites (but no maps). The country descriptions give the basic facts (name, size, capital, population etc.) and socio-economic statistics (GNP, unemployment, foreign trade etc.). (See also Nos. 13, 19, 20 and 22 below.)

(7) Dictionary cum onomastic information

There are many different sub-types of dictionaries of personal and place names, overlapping with biographical and geographical reference works (see Nos. 8 and 9 be-

² Kaoru Akasu, co-editor of the bilingual *LEJD*, has drawn my attention to the fact that it was originally called *Union Dictionary* (first published in 1972), conceived as a combination of a dictionary and a grammar book.

low). An early example, first issued in 1894, is the *CCN*, sub-titled *A Pronouncing and Etymological Dictionary of Names in Geography, Biography, Mythology, History, Ethnology, Art, Archaeology, Fiction, etc., etc.* (sic), a 1,085-page spin-off of the American 10-volume *CDC* edited by William D. Whitney (1889-95). It contains informative entries on both *Joseph Haydn* and *Maria Theresa (or Theresia)* (sic), each with dates and achievements, and cross-references to other entries in the alphabetical list (from the river *Aa* to the town *Zwolle*).

(8) Dictionary cum biographical information

The *DBPP* is a 641-page biographical dictionary "containing the Chief Events in the Lives of Eminent Persons of All Ages and Nations, preceded by the Biographies and Genealogies of the Chief Representatives of the Royal Houses of the World" in a single alphabetical sequence, with introductory essays and family trees illustrating the descent of rulers in 34 countries. I was not disappointed when I looked up *F.J. Haydn* (although he is described as German) and *Maria Theresia* (although she is called *Maria Theresa*) as well as the lexicographers Samuel Johnson, Noah Webster, John Ogilvie, the Grimm brothers and Emile Littré.

(9) Dictionary cum atlas

Atlases are another genre neglected in dictionary research. Occasionally one is surprised by unusual combinations, although after a few consultations they seem to make good sense. The *GA*, e.g., consists of (a) an introduction, (b) a calendar of gardening events, (c) 146 pages of maps of different parts of Britain, in order of counties, (d) a 62-page gazetteer, and (e) an index. (Note that the term 'atlas' is used in a different sense in the *DTV-Atlas* series; see No. 22 below).

(10) Dictionary cum lifestyle book

YMG is a 96-page handbook, part of a series of Information/Activities/Reference guidelines on such topics as 'eating well', 'having a baby' and 'indoor plants', consisting of (a) a table of contents, (b) brief discursive sections on the nature, origin and types of yoga, (c) descriptions of activities and positions, (d) plans for beginners' and more advanced programmes, (e) a list of postures (in alphabetical order of their Sanskrit names, with diagrammatic drawings), (f) a glossary of health terms, (g) a book list, (h) a list of courses and useful addresses, (i) a glossary of yoga terms, (j) an index, and (k) credits for photographs and contributing experts.

(11) Dictionary cum catalogue

Catalogues vary by subject and type of product listed, using a wide range of reference structures (thematic and/or alphabetic, title and/or author name, etc.). The *REDCDC* contains in the 1,244 pages of its 18th edition (revisions are no longer published) the following components: (a) an introduction, (b) a 'main section' listing CDs of pop music in alphabetical order of artists, (c) a similar list of 'compilations', (d) 'soundtracks' and (e) 'collections', plus (f) a short list of 'composer collections'. Most entries carry information on the respective artist/composer ('black strip' heading), the title of the recording, its tracks, the product number, release date and record label.

(12) Dictionary cum calendar

One of the prototypes modelled on the internationally renowned (*Stein*) *Kulturfahrplan* is the *CMW*, a chronologically arranged list, first published in 1966, of (a) important events (displayed on the left-hand pages) and (b) achievements in the arts and sciences, politics and sport (grouped under 12 subject-headings on the right-hand pages), with a total of 709 pages, followed by a 310-page index of subjects and personalities.

(13) Dictionary cum encyclopedia

We have already seen (cf. Collison, Kafker, McArthur, Spree) that the tradition of the encyclopedic dictionary is strong for many countries and languages. My own favourite in this genre is the *RDGID*, a two-volume alphabetic dictionary with a total of 1,920 pages and information on words and etymologies, things and ideas, places and personalities, using a clear layout of two text columns and a narrower marginal column in which coloured illustrations, maps and the pronunciation key are located. Some topics of general interest, e.g. *alphabet, brain, Impressionists, playing cards, sea-life, stringed instruments*, and *train*, are treated in larger panels.

(14) Pedagogical dictionary cum encyclopedia

The encyclopedic learner's dictionary described in Stark (1999) can be exemplified by *LDELIC*, a reference work consisting of 31 pages of front-matter, 1,528 pages of alphabetically arranged entries, and 27 pages of back-matter. The front-matter includes (a) grammar codes, (b) pronunciation table, (c) contents list, (d) preface, (e) explanatory chart and (f) user's guide, the back-matter has information on (g) numbers, (h) weights and measures, (i) military ranks, (j) word formation, (k) defining vocabulary, (l) irregular verbs, and (m) short forms and labels. The 80,000 entries (including 15,000 on encyclopedically and culturally significant words) in the A-Z part are supplemented by 804 illustrations, 16 encyclopedic 'features', 405 cultural 'notes' and several large and small maps.

(15) Dictionary cum literature guide

BGRG, a 310-page guide to recurring literary themes, consists of alphabetically arranged articles on specific authors (from Douglas Adams to Émile Zola) with 'reading skeins' to books of similar topics (e.g. from Jane Austen's 'social comedy' *Pride and Prejudice* to William Thackeray's *Vanity Fair*), interspersed with 'menus' of suggested reading (from Action Thrillers to Weepies), plus an author and title index.

(16) Dictionary cum film guide

One of my favourite reference works is the *HFVG*, an annually revised annotated listing of most films and videos in alphabetical order of their titles. Its 18th edition has 991 pages, with (a) an introduction, (b) the A-Z guide, and appendices of (c) Academy Award winners, (d) four-star films (by title and year), (e) three-star films (by title and year), and (f) an index of leading directors. Each entry contains publicity tags, ratings (from none to four stars), country of origin, year of release, production details, a one-sentence synopsis of the plot, a brief assessment, and credits to director, cast and other staff, occasionally with quotes from critics and additional notes. Logos used, e.g. for type of product, points of interest and Academy Award details, are explained at the bottom of every page.

(17) Dictionary cum travel guide

The most well-known example of this sub-genre is the 'phrase book', and one of its representatives is the *EPB*, sub-titled "All the phrases you need to make yourself understood in 14 European languages ...", with a total of 318 pages containing a preface and a 'reference section' in addition to the language sections which are uniformly subdivided into: guide to pronunciation, the alphabet, greetings, questions, basic words and expressions considered useful for specific communicative situations (such as money, travel, accommodation, food and drinks, services, etc.).

(18) Dictionary cum thesaurus

As Werner Hüllen's two books (1999, 2004) have shown, the early tradition of English dictionaries was 'topical', i.e. based on the thematic arrangement of lexical and factual information, and the pioneering approach in Roget's *Thesaurus* was to group synonymous words and phrases into notional classes and divisions. Until recently, combinations of alphabetic and thematic word-lists have been rare (Franz Josef Hausmann [1990] discusses the French example of the so-called 'analogical dictionary'). However, when Nicoletta Calzolari (1988) suggested that it is relatively easy with the means of IT to combine the two formats of the alphabetic dictionary and the systematic thesaurus, several dictionary-thesauruses have become available for English, such as the *CDT*, which consists of 8 pages of front-matter (foreword, guide to the text, abbreviations used) and 63 pages of back-matter (guide to writing, including letters and CV) in addition to the 856-page A-Z list, with each page divided into two parts, (i) traditional dictionary information at the top and (ii) information on synonyms at the bottom, although they do not always match well, perhaps because they are based on different products previously issued by the publisher. Thus, the top two thirds of p. 717 consist of entries from *soapstone* to *soft*, and the bottom one third of thesaurus entries from *soar* to *sodden* (which means that the 'T' reference from within the entry on *sofa* to synonyms of that word in the thesaurus part requires a move forward to the subsequent page, which contains thesaurus entries for the words *sofa* to *solid*).

(19) Dictionary cum terminology

Within the very long tradition of the terminological dictionary, Manuel Alvar Ezquerro (1992) singles out the 4-volume *DC* (1786-93) for its coverage of general and technical vocabulary not only of Spanish, but also of their equivalents in French, Latin and Italian. Others, such as Fred Riggs (1989), stress the differences between lexicography as a semasiological task (from word to meaning) and terminography as an onomasiological operation (from meaning to word) rather than their similarity, i.e. the codification of LSP terms. In practice, they vary considerably in purpose and coverage, often without respecting the distinction between lexical dictionary and terminological glossary, with or without definitions, with or without equivalents in other languages. In the National Meteorological Library and Archive of the Met Office in Exeter I found the 335-page *MG*, consisting of (a) a foreword by the editor of the 6th edition, (b) a preface by the Met Office, (c) a list of symbols used, (d) the alphabetical list of articles with discursive explanations of the technical terms of meteorology, and (e) a bibliography.

(20) Dictionary cum picture book

Many dictionaries contain pictorial illustrations, which have been discussed by Werner Hupka (1989) in terms of art and technology, design and effectiveness. The *OVD*, developed in Canada, provides on its 959 pages clear and lively drawings in colour which illustrate multifarious objects arranged under 28 conceptual headings, from *Astronomy* and *Geography* to *Weapons* and *Symbols*, together with the associated vocabulary in English, French, German and Spanish, plus appropriate indexes. *Music* is treated between the sections entitled *Office Automation* and *Creative Leisure Activities*, starting with a page depicting 'traditional instruments' such as *zither*, *lyre*, *balalaika*, *mandolin* and *banjo*, but the *guitar* (acoustic as well as electric) does not appear until 11 pages later, at the end of the 'stringed instruments', although without taking into account recent developments, e.g. in 'jazz' and 'western' models.

(21) Print dictionary cum electronic dictionary

Various electronic reference works, sometimes called 'interactive', are now available which synthesise dictionary information with other details, adding new features and formats which, however, have not been subjected to systematic investigation (cf. Hartmann 2001: 67 on new 'access structures'). The *HMME* is such a hybrid which, once installed via CD on my computer, allowed me to consult difficult words, survey its 39,000 articles, pursue biographies, such as those of *Haydn* and *Maria Theresa* (sic), and where necessary follow up additional clues to relevant events, portraits and other pictorial illustrations, quotations and sources, country facts, web links, and the like, enjoying the ease of coloured cross-references between articles, e.g. musical instruments related to the *guitar*. There has been a trend in countries where IT is dominant, such as Japan, for suppliers of hand-held calculators to combine a range of related (and sometimes unrelated) dictionaries from different publishers for specific user groups, such as language students and businessmen. Sales are impressive³, but there is little feedback available on which of these hybrids are used for which purposes.

(22) Dictionary cum dictionary

There is a tradition, e.g. by the German publisher of the famous *Duden*, to market related dictionaries as a home or office 'library' (see also Nos. 4 and 5 above). Nowadays, with the support of IT, it has become relatively easy for publishers to group complementary dictionaries together, under such titles as 'reference set' and 'reference shelf' (see No. 21 above, including Footnote 2). The German *DTV-Atlas* series provides information on specific subjects, not in the form of textbooks or terminological glossaries, but by a combination of thematically arranged text (on the right-hand page) and explanatory tables and diagrammatic illustrations in colour (on the left-hand page). The term 'atlas' has become accepted for this format, although it can be misleading to the uninitiated (see No. 9 above). In the historical part of the double volume on music, the 591-page *DTVAM*, I found Haydn's *Theresienmesse* (and the name *Maria Theresia*) as well as some of the musical hybrids, such as *Tango* and *Flamenco* (but not *Kolo*).

³ Shigeru Yamada (personal communication, 27/06/05) has sent me a list of over 80 dictionary titles in various combinations produced by Casio, Seiko and Sharp for Japanese, English and other languages, covering such subjects as spelling and synonymy, travel, business, health, history, computer terms, and literature.

(23) Dictionary cum magazine

For a more unusual hybrid we turn to *HH*, a cross between a catalogue and a periodical. Its latest 119-page edition is sub-titled *The Toy and Model Making Annual* and includes illustrations, descriptions, order codes and prices for (a) doll's houses, (b) castles, farms and garages, (c) wheeled toys, (d) novelty projects, (e) ships, boats and accessories, (f) craft kits and books, (g) tools and materials, (h) archives (fretwork designs and models), (i) end-of-line sale items, and (j) an index.

(24) Dictionary cum concordance

At the intersection between reference works and literature lies the so-called 'author's dictionary', described by Olga Karpova (2003) as a concordance or glossary of the vocabulary used in a writer's single text or complete works. More than 300 monolingual and bilingual dictionaries are now available for English authors since Geoffrey Chaucer, notably Marvin Spevack's *ST* (1993).

(25) Dictionary cum novel

Finally, the union of lexicography and literature has also produced a rather unexpected offspring, the 'dictionary novel'. I know of at least three members of this new family, by Andreas Okopenko (1970/1983) in German, Milorad Pavić (1983/1988) in Serbo-Croatian, and Han Shaogong (1996/2003) in Chinese, the latter two being available in English translation. Han's 323-page book is a moving biographical account in the form of 110 discursive dictionary articles (together with a preface, information on pinyin transliteration and list of entries, an afterword, glossary and list of characters) describing the experiences of a young urban intellectual who was sent to the country to do agricultural work during the Cultural Revolution. It is characterised by Jennifer Eagleton (2005: 65) as follows: "Hang Shaogong, by subverting both the 'normal' narrative structure of fiction and the 'authoritative' nature of reference works, firmly opposes set guidelines or dogma on thinking, art and literature."

5. IMPLICATIONS

This paper has probably raised more issues than it could settle. Several questions remain open, such as: Is the multi-purpose dictionary an incomplete hybrid rather than a 'general dictionary'? Do we have a full account of all the various specialised exemplars? What do we know about their users? Does IT allow all possible combinations, and how should they be developed? What are the (com-mercial/scholarly/technological) limits to lexicographic hybridisation?

In the end, I managed to find answers to most of my questions raised in the introduction, by consulting some of the dictionaries surveyed here, except perhaps the one about why Haydn had dedicated this particular mass to Maria Theresia. The programme notes (another mixed-media publication) of the choir concert attempted a partial explanation: the name day of the wife of the emperor, and her commission for another work performed a year later, the *Te Deum*, but I am not sure whether I will ever be able to ascertain all the relevant facts...

REFERENCES

Cited dictionaries and other reference works:

- BGRG* = BLOOMSBURY GOOD READING GUIDE comp. Kenneth McLeish. Bloomsbury Publishing, London 1988 [paperback edn 1989]
- CCN* = THE CENTURY CYCLOPEDIA OF NAMES ed. Benjamin E. Smith. The Century Co./The Times, New York/London 1904 [1st edn 1894]
- CDC* = THE CENTURY DICTIONARY AND CYCLOPEDIA ed. William D. Whitney. The Century Co., New York 1889-95
- CDT* = COLLINS [ENGLISH] DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS. PAPERBACK ed. Lorna Gilmour et al. HarperCollins, Glasgow 2002 [1st edn 1994]
- CMW* = CHRONOLOGY OF THE MODERN WORLD 1763-1965 comp. Neville Williams. Penguin Books, Harmondsworth 1969 [1st edn Barrie & Rockliff 1966]
- DBPP* = DICTIONARY OF BIOGRAPHY, PAST AND PRESENT ed. Benjamin Vincent Ward, Lock & Co., London n.d. [1877? 1st edn 1870 HAYDNS' UNIVERSAL INDEX OF BIOGRAPHY]
- DC* = DICCIONARIO CASTELLANO CON LAS VOCES DE CIENCIAS Y ARTES Y SUS CORRESPONDIENTES EN LAS TRES LENGUAS FRANCESA LATINA E ITALIANA comp. Esteban de Terreros y Pando. Madrid 1786-93 [facsimile reprint Arco-Libros, Madrid 1987, microfiche reproduction ETC, Barcelona 1988]
- DDEE* = DICTIONARY OF DICTIONARIES AND EMINENT ENCYCLOPEDIAS comp. Thomas Kabdebo & Neil Armstrong. Bowker-Saur, London 1997 [1st edn 1992]
- DL* = DICTIONARY OF LEXICOGRAPHY comp. Reinhard Hartmann & Gregory James. Routledge/ Taylor and Francis, London 1998/2001 [Japanese translation ed. by Shigeru Takebayashi et al. Kenkyusha, Tokyo 2003]
- DNB* = [OXFORD] DICTIONARY OF NATIONAL BIOGRAPHY ed. Brian Harrison. Oxford University Press, Oxford 2004
- DTVAM* = DTV-ATLAS ZUR MUSIK comp. Ulrich Michels. Deutscher Taschenbuch Verlag, München [2 volumes] 1985
- EL* = EUROPA-LEXIKON. LÄNDER, POLITIK, INSTITUTIONEN comp. Wolf D. Gruner & Wichard Woyke. C.H. Beck, München 2004
- EPB* = EUROPEAN PHRASE BOOK comp. by the staff of Berlitz Guides. Berlitz Publishing, Lausanne 20th impression 1991 [1st edn 1974]
- FHRE* = A FIRST HANDBOOK OF THE ROOTS OF ENGLISH comp. Norman Bird. Lapine Education and Language Services, St. Helier, Jersey 1990
- GA* = GARDENERS' ATLAS ed. Marcin Miller. Paragraph Publishing, Norfolk 2002
- HFVG* = HALLIWELL'S FILM & VIDEO GUIDE 2003 ed. John Walker. HarperCollins Entertainment, London 18th edn 2002 [1st edn Granada 1977]
- HH* = HOBBIES HANDBOOK. Hobbies, Dereham, Norfolk 2005
- HMME* = THE HUTCHINSON MULTIMEDIA ENCYCLOPEDIA 1997. Ed. Elizabeth Clarke. Helicon & ATTICA Cybernetics, Oxford 1996 [1st edn 1992]
- IEW* = INDOGERMANISCHES ETYMOLOGISCHES WÖRTERBUCH comp. Julius Pokorny. Francke, Bern 1959-69
- LDEL* = LONGMAN DICTIONARY OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND CULTURE ed. Della Summers. Longman/Pearson Education, Harlow 1992
- LEJD* = LIGHTHOUSE ENGLISH-JAPANESE DICTIONARY comp. Shigeru Takebayashi et al. Kenkyusha, Tokyo 1984 [4th edn 2002]
- LLCE* = LONGMAN LEXICON OF CONTEMPORARY ENGLISH (ENGLISH-CHINESE EDITION) comp. Tom McArthur, transl. Chang Shing-wei. Longman, Hong Kong 1992
- MEDAL* = MACMILLAN ENGLISH DICTIONARY FOR ADVANCED LEARNERS ed. Michael Rundell. Macmillan Education/Bloomsbury Publishing, Oxford 2002
- MG* = METEOROLOGICAL GLOSSARY ed. R.P.W. Lewis/Meteorological Office. HMSO, London 6th edn 1991 [1st edn 1916]
- NSOED* = THE NEW SHORTER OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY ed. Lesley Brown. Clarendon Press, Oxford [2 volumes] 1993
- OED* = THE OXFORD ENGLISH DICTIONARY ed. James A.H. Murray et al. Oxford: Clarendon Press 1st edn 1884-1928, Supplement 1933 and 1972-86, 2nd edn 1989
- OVD* = OXFORD VISUAL DICTIONARY [English - French - German - Spanish] ed. Jean-Claude Corbeil. Oxford University Press, Oxford [& Éditions Quebec/Amérique, Montréal] 1997

- RDGID* = READER'S DIGEST GREAT ILLUSTRATED DICTIONARY [in 2 volumes] ed. Robert Ilson. The Reader's Digest Association, London 1984
- REDCDC* = R.E.D. CD CATALOGUE ed. Matthew Garbutt. Retail Entertainment Data Publishing, London 18th edn 1998
- RT* = ROGET'S THESAURUS OF ENGLISH WORDS AND PHRASES ed. George Davidson. Longman, London 2002 [1st edn 1852]
- ST* = A SHAKESPEARE THESAURUS comp. Marvin Spevack. G. Olms, Hildesheim 1993
- VWBD* = VARIANTENWÖRTERBUCH DES DEUTSCHEN ed. Ulrich Ammon et al. W. de Gruyter, Berlin 2004
- WPGSSD* = [THE NEW INTERNATIONAL] WEBSTER'S POCKET GRAMMAR, SPEECH & STYLE DICTIONARY [OF THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE]. Trident Press International, n.p. 1997/98
- YMG* = YOGA. MACDONALD GUIDELINES comp. Sophy Hoare. Macdonald Educational Ltd., London 1977

Other literature:

- Alvar Ezquerra, M. (1992/1995/2003) "Los diccionarios del español en su historia", In *Revista Española de Lingüística* (1992), [modified in] *International Journal of Lexicography* 8, 3 (1995), pp. 173-201, [reprinted as 'Dictionaries of Spanish in their historical context' in Hartmann 2003, Vol. II, pp. 343-374]
- Béjoint, H. (1994/2000) *Tradition and Innovation in Modern English Dictionaries*. Oxford University Press, Oxford [2nd edn entitled *Modern Lexicography. An Introduction*]
- Calzolari, N. (1988) "The dictionary and the thesaurus can be combined", In *Relational Models of the Lexicon. Representing Knowledge in Semantic Networks* ed. M.W. Evens. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp. 75-96
- Collison, R. (1964) *Encyclopaedias: Their History throughout the Ages*. Hafner, New York/London
- Creswell, T.J. (1975/2003) *Usage in Dictionaries and Dictionaries of Usage*. University of Alabama Press, University AL [Conclusion reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. I, pp. 230-247]
- Dodd, W.S. (1989/2003) "Lexic computing and the dictionary of the future", In *Lexicographers and Their Works* ed. G. James. University of Exeter Press, Exeter, pp. 83-93 [reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 351-362]
- Eagleton, J. (2005) "'Pressing names' - creating meaning in a fictional dictionary", In *Words in Asian Cultural Contexts. Proceedings of the 4th Asialex Conference, 1-3 June 2005* ed. V.B.Y. Ooi et al. National University of Singapore, Singapore, pp. 60-65
- Haas, M. (1962) "What belongs in the bilingual dictionary?" In *Problems in Lexicography* ed. F.W. Householder & S. Saporta (Publications of Indiana University Research Centre in Anthropology, Folklore, and Linguistics 21). Indiana University Press, Bloomington IN, pp. 45-50
- Han S.G. (1996/2003) *A Dictionary of Maqiao* [translated from Chinese to English by Julia Lovell], Columbia University Press, New York
- Hartmann, R.R.K. (2001) *Teaching and Researching Lexicography*. Routledge/Taylor & Francis, London
----- (ed.) (2003) *Lexicography: Critical Concepts* [3 volumes], Routledge/Taylor & Francis, London
- Hausmann, F.J. (1990) "Le dictionnaire analogique", In *Wörterbücher/Dictionaries/Dictionnaires. An International Encyclopedia of Lexicography* eds. J.F. Hausmann et al. (Handbücher zur Sprach- und Kommunikationswissenschaft Vols. 5.1, 5.2, 5.3). W. de Gruyter, Berlin, pp. 1094-1099
- Haydn, F.J. (1799/n.d. [1997?]) *Theresienmesse/Maria Theresa Mass*. Novello Publishing, London
- Hüllen, W. (1999) *English Dictionaries 800-1700. The Topical Tradition*. Clarendon Press, Oxford
----- (2004) *A History of Roget's Thesaurus. Origins, Development, and Design*. Oxford University Press, Oxford
- Hupka, W. (1989/2003) *Wort und Bild. Die Illustrationen in Wörterbüchern und Enzyklopädien* (Lexicographica Series Maior 22). M. Niemeyer, Tübingen [English translation of the Chapter "How pictorial illustrations interact with verbal information in the dictionary entry: a case study" reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 363-390]
- James, G. (1994) "Towards a typology of bilingualised dictionaries", In *Meeting Points in Language Studies. Working Papers* ed. G. James. The Hong Kong University of Science and Technology Language Centre, Hong Kong, pp. 184-196
- Kafker, F.A. (1981/2003) "The *Encyclopédie* in relation to the nine predecessors", In *Notable Encyclopedias of the 17th and 18th Centuries: Nine Predecessors of the Encyclopédie*, ed. by F.A. Kafker. The Voltaire Foundation, Oxford, pp. 223-237 [reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. II, pp. 39-51]

- Karpova, O.M. (2003) "Author concordances, with special reference to Shakespeare", In Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 112-123
- Katz, B. (1998/2003) *Cuneiform to Computer. A History of Reference Sources*, The Scarecrow Press, Lanham MD [Chapter 1 "Reference books from cuneiform to computer" reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 405-421]
- Landau, S.I. (1984/2001) *Dictionaries. The Art and Craft of Lexicography* [2nd edn], Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Marello, C. (1998) "Hornby's bilingualized dictionaries", *International Journal of Lexicography* 11 (4), pp. 292-314
- McArthur, T. (1986) *Worlds of Reference. Lexicography, Learning and Language from the Clay Tablet to the Computer*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- (1998/2003) "What then is reference science?", In *Living Words. Language, Lexicography and the Knowledge Revolution*, University of Exeter Press, Exeter, pp. 215-222 [reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 422-428]
- (2005) "The first learner's dictionary: the Chinese dimension", *The Hong Kong Linguist* 25, pp. 21-26
- McCalman, I. et al. (eds.) (1996) *National Biographies & National Identity. A Critical Approach to Theory and Editorial Practice*, Humanities Research Centre, Australian National University, Canberra
- Okopenko, A. (1970/1983) *Lexikon einer sentimental Reise zum Exporteurtreffen in Druden*. Residenz-Verlag, Salzburg [Ullstein paperback edn 1983]
- Osselson, N.E. (2000/2003) "Murray and his European counterparts", In *Lexicography and the OED. Pioneers in the Untrodden Forest* ed. L. Mugglestone. Oxford University Press, Oxford, pp. 59-76 [reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. II, pp. 109-127]
- Pavić, M. (1983/1988) *Dictionary of the Khazars. A Lexicon Novel in 100,000 Words* [translated from Serbo-Croatian to English by Christina Pribičević-Zorić], A.A. Knopf, New York
- Riggs, F.W. (1989/2003) "Terminology and lexicography: their complementarity", *International Journal of Lexicography* 2 (2), pp. 89-110 [reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 328-350]
- Shcherba, L.V. (1940/2003) "Opyt obshchei teorii leksikografii", In *Izvestija Akademii Nauk SSSR* 3, pp. 89-117 [English translation "Towards a general theory of lexicography" by D. Farina reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 11-50]
- Spree, U. (2000) *Das Streben nach Wissen. Eine vergleichende Gattungsgeschichte der populären Enzyklopädie in Deutschland und Großbritannien im 19. Jahrhundert* (Communication 24), M. Niemeyer, Tübingen
- Stark, M.P. (1999/2003) *Encyclopedic Learners' Dictionaries. A Study of Their Design Features from the User Perspective* (Lexicographica Series Maior 92). M. Niemeyer, Tübingen [part of Chapter 1 and Conclusion reprinted in Hartmann 2003, Vol. III, pp. 124-134]
- Steiner, R. (1984) "Guidelines for reviewers of bilingual dictionaries", *Dictionaries* 6, pp. 166-181
- Svensén, B. (1993) *Practical Lexicography. Principles and Methods of Dictionary-making*, Oxford University Press, Oxford [new Swedish edn 2004, Norstedt, Stockholm]
- Tono, Y. (2004) "Research on the use of electronic dictionaries for language learning: methodological considerations", In *Computer-mediated Lexicography in the Foreign Language Learning Context* ed. M.C. Campoy Cubillo & M.P. Safont Jordà (Col·lecció Estudis Filològics 18). Publicacions de la Universitat Jaume I, Castelló de la Plana, pp. 13-28
- Wiegand, H.E. (1998) *Wörterbuchforschung. Untersuchungen zur Wörterbuchbenutzung, zur Theorie, Geschichte, Kritik und Automatisierung der Lexikographie* [1. Teilband], W. de Gruyter, Berlin
- ed. (1998, 2002) *Perspektiven der pädagogischen Lexikographie des Deutschen. Untersuchungen anhand des 'Langenscheidt GWDaF' und des 'de Gruyter WDaF'* (2 volumes: Lexicographica Series Maior 86, 110). M. Niemeyer, Tübingen

ČISTI ILI KOMBINOVANI? RAZVOJ MEŠOVITIH VRSTA REČNIKA

Rajnhard R. K. Hartman

Ovaj rad se bavi "hibridnim" vrstama rečnika i drugih priručnika. Nasuprot tradiciji u kojoj opšti rečnici postaju usko specijalizovani, javlja se tendencija kombinovanja dve ili više vrsta "čistih" tipova rečnika posebne namene, npr. kombinovanje alfabetskog i tematskog rečnika, opšteg rečnika i tehničkog rečnika, rečnika i tezaurusa, rečnika i enciklopedije, jednojezičnog i dvojezičnog rečnika, i slično. Razmatraju se primeri različitih podvrsta (s obzirom da je nauka o rečnicima zanemarila njihovo izučavanje), u cilju određivanja opštih tendencija i implikacija, naročito u vezi sa njihovim mogućim daljim razvojem uz pomoć informacione tehnologije.

Ključne reči: *Leksikografija, istorija rečnika, tipologija rečnika, kritika rečnika, struktura rečnika, upotreba rečnika, hibridne vrste, (elektronski) priručnici.*