PURE OR HYBRID?
THE DEVELOPMENT OF MIXED DICTIONARY GENRES

UDC 81’374

Reinhard R. K. Hartmann
University of Exeter, University of Birmingham
Email: r.r.k.hartmann@exeter.ac.uk

Abstract. This paper explores 'hybrid' genres of dictionaries and other reference works. Against the tradition of general dictionaries becoming ever more specialised, there has also been a growing trend of mixing two or more 'pure' dictionary types for achieving specific purposes, e.g. the combination of alphabetic and thematic dictionary, general dictionary and technical glossary, dictionary and thesaurus, dictionary and encyclopedia, monolingual and bilingual dictionary, etc. Examples of these various sub-types are discussed (admitting that dictionary research has neglected their study), with the aim of determining overall trends and implications, particularly with regard to the possibility of their further development with the means of information technology.

Key words: Lexicography, dictionary history, dictionary typology, dictionary criticism, dictionary structure, dictionary use, hybrid genres, (electronic) reference works

"Purity is obscurity." (Ogden Nash, 1959)

1. INTRODUCTION

I was puzzled, as part of my recent experience as a member of the University choir singing one of Joseph Haydn's masses, composed in 1799 and entitled (in English) Maria Theresa Mass. With my Austrian background, I queried this title, which in all German-language publications I know is called Theresienmesse, based on Maria Theresia. However, the English form of this name is usually given as Maria (or Marie) Theresa. Where does this come from, why was the mass dedicated to her in the first place, and which kind of reference work would be most appropriate for checking the facts? Is this information included in any general dictionary, or do I have to consult a more specialised reference book such as a biographical encyclopedia? Or are there perhaps compromise types that contain both general words and historical names?

Received September 6, 2005
A partial solution may actually come from the field of music: there are many mixed
genres, such as 'crossover' (gospel and pop), 'fusion' (jazz and rock), and various folk tra-
ditions, often themselves of a mongrel nature and collectively known nowadays as 'world
music' (ethic/indigenous rather than Western/international), such as Argentinean tango,
Andalusian flamenco and Serbian kolo. All this is, of course, reminiscent of what in lin-
guistics would be called 'creolisation' (and in gardening 'cross-breeding'). So perhaps I
should look for a hybrid dictionary covering both general words and relevant facts from
music and history?

Starting from this dilemma, I attempt in this paper¹ to explore some of the issues in
distinguishing the many kinds of multi-purpose reference works available today, and their
potential for future development.

2. GENERAL OR SPECIALISED?

The most obvious dichotomy seems to be between the 'general-purpose' dictionary
and the 'specialised' dictionary, the former usually with a strong emphasis on the general
lexicon and the latter devoted to more limited knowledge. In many lexicographic tradi-
tions with which I am familiar, there is a discernible gradual development from the gen-
eral dictionary – in the form of a glossed and indexed word-list -- to specialised reference
works which include more and more detailed information types. The index that allows
access to the required information is either based on the writing system of the respective
language (typically the alphabetic order) or on a topical system of knowledge (thematic
order), sometimes in combination.

In most cultures, dictionaries initially focus on general vocabulary items (English
words like guitar), sometimes in contrast to 'hard words', such as bandora or mandolin,
and other related members of the lexical family of plucked string instruments ('archaisms'
like gittern and lyre, 'regionalisms' like banjo and ukulele, 'foreignisms' like sitar or kora,
'neologisms' like electric guitar and bass guitar, and 'technicisms' like slide guitar or stratocaster). Gradually, other information categories are added to the general dictionary,
such as spelling (orthographic conventions), pronunciation (phonetic transcriptions),
grammar (coded word classes), meaning (definitions or translation equivalents), etymology
(historical details), onomastic information (personal and place names), encyclopedic
information, etc. At the same time, specialised or 'segmental' dictionaries have also
evolved for each of these separate information types, e.g. pronunciation dictionaries,
etymological dictionaries, dialect dictionaries, synonym dictionaries, dictionaries of idi-
oms, dictionaries of names, etc. Recent developments in electronic lexicography have
made it possible to combine all these various products; indeed, most computer word-
processing systems nowadays automatically include both a spelling dictionary and a the-
saurus!

There are also more technical reference works (sometimes referred to, e.g. by Herbert
Ernst Wiegand [1998], as 'non-lexicographic' types), such as almanacs, atlases, bibliogra-
phies, calendars, catalogues, chronologies, companions, directories, handbooks, manuals,
phone-books, ready reckoners, subject guides, time-tables, who's who's, etc. The problem

¹I acknowledge with thanks the help and comments received from Lynn Hartmann and Kay Morris (both on art
and gardening), Steve Martin (on music), Tim Rickwood (on computer scanning), Helen Wells (on meteorology) as well as Violeta Stojičić, Shigeru Yamada, Kaoru Akasu, Gregory James and Young-kuk Jeong.
is that it is very hard to draw a definite boundary line between lexicographic and non-lexicographic types of reference works, and they often seem to be available in unpredictable formats; hence Henri Béjoint's resigned remark (1994: 37) that "(d)ictionaries come in more varieties than can ever be classified in a simple taxonomy." One way out of this quandary would be an overarching 'reference science' as proposed by Tom McArthur (1998) which might provide a better practical and theoretical framework for evaluating the various genres, under three headings: (a) lexicography, for all kinds of dictionaries, (b) encyclopedics, for encyclopedias, atlases, gazetteers, almanacs and manuals, and (c) a third branch (which does not yet have an established subject field title) for other reference works such as tabulations, directories and catalogues, including electronic versions of all of these.

3. PURE OR HYBRID?

New dictionary genres which are the result of 'hybridisation', referred to variously as mixed, combined, compromise, blended, or mongrel types, are appearing all the time, presumably to meet a latent demand for them. In the DL (Hartmann & James 1998: 69), the following definition is provided for hybrid:

"The combination of one or more types of REFERENCE WORK in a single product. Often there are no distinct designations for these compromise genres, which include 'dictionary-cum-atlas', 'dictionary-cum-encyclopedia', 'dictionary-cum-grammar', 'dictionary-cum-thesaurus', 'dictionary-cum-usage guide', and 'monolingual-cum-bilingual dictionary'. …""

What this characterisation does not make explicit is the deplorable fact that in the literature on dictionaries, these hybrid genres have received very limited attention. The general textbooks on lexicography are remarkably silent on them, although they occasionally admit the long-established practice of including specialised information, such as slang, technical terms and names, in many of our general-language dictionaries (Svensén 1993/2004, Landau 1984/2001). The situation is only marginally better within the main branches of dictionary research.

Thus, in dictionary history, Tom McArthur (1986: 109) explicitly recognises the mutual relations between the dictionary and the encyclopedia, stressing the fact that "… the two great genres of educational reference have been intertwined throughout their histories, and that in countries like France and the United States such hybrids as encyclopedic dictionaries have been produced for years and will go on being produced." Alluding to the sub-title of McArthur's book, Bill Katz (1998) offers a history of multifarious reference works from the perspective of library science. He not only confirms the frequent combination of encyclopedic and dictionary information, but provides a fascinating survey of such 'reference sources' as chronicles, manuals, maps, biographies, bibliographies and government documents.

In the specialism usually referred to as dictionary typology, an effort is made to classify this variety of dictionaries and other reference works that we find in the world into clearly delineated types or genres. An early pioneer in this field was the Russian linguist Lev V. Shcherba (1940) whose classification was based on six abstract dichotomies based on content, arrangement, language and approach which he intended to elaborate in
later studies (but never did). Shcherba's query whether 'pure' dictionary types actually exist becomes a practical issue when metalexicographers start to seriously examine specific exemplars. Thus, Noel Osselton (2000/2003: 109) uses the term 'hybrid' for the Oxford English Dictionary compiled by James Murray et al. and the historical dictionaries compiled by the Grimm brothers, Emile Littré and Matthias de Vries, as they "combine two functions: (1) to provide a full description of the vocabulary of their own day – words in use, their meanings, their status, pronunciation, and so on; but (2) at the same time to order and present all kinds of information about its past."

Other combined genres have rarely received this kind of scholarly attention. The trend towards encyclopedic dictionaries as diagnosed by McArthur is examined in a comparative history of the 'popular encyclopedia' in 19th-century Germany and Great Britain by Ulrike Spree (2000), but although several cases such as the Brockhaus-Conversations-Lexikon and the Encyclopaedia Britannica are explored, the range and nature of sub-genres from the multi-volume encyclopaedia to the one-volume (Universal-)Lexikon is not always clearly laid out against the background of the historical development of encyclopedias and that of the French Encyclopédie in particular (cf. Collison 1964, Kafker 1981). Thus both the history and the typology of mixed-genre dictionaries remain a desideratum (more on specific hybrid genres below).

It should be the task of dictionary criticism to verify the content(s) and function(s) of particular dictionary types. Although this has been attempted for certain individual products, and some criteria for assessing these have been proposed (such as Roger Steiner's 'guidelines' for reviewing bilingual dictionaries [1984], or Herbert Ernst Wiegand's commissioned collective critiques of two dictionaries of German for foreign learners [1998, 2002]), there are very few attempts at assessing the purpose and quality of hybrid genres. One interesting set of papers from a conference in Australia (McCalman 1996) considers the case for a critical approach to the 'biographical dictionary' such as the (New Oxford) Dictionary of National Biography, but without agreeing on an agenda for establishing the minimal requirements of such ventures in future.

Dictionary structure is the branch of dictionary research in which two important questions are investigated: (i) which information categories should be selected for treatment in a reference work? and (ii) how should they be presented for the benefit of those seeking this information? Many years ago, the American linguist Mary Haas (1962) discussed such desiderata from the point of view of bilingual dictionaries; her list is still relevant today, as it includes, inter alia, translation equivalent(s) for each word or expression, grammatical information, usage levels, names of personages past and present, place names, names of famous books and plays, names of characters therein, specialised vocabulary items of all the sciences, professions, manufacturing industries and trades, information about correct spellings, information needed to instruct the user in the proper way to pronounce each word, etc.

But in addition to the double issue of how to arrange and index the selected information in a sensible list (macrostructure) and how to treat it inside meaningful entries (microstructure), there are other elements that are important for the successful production and use of a reference work, such as the totality of the wordlist together with any 'outside matter' (megastructure), their consultation via search guides (access structure) and cross-references (mediostructure), and the relative attention paid to linguistic-lexical and encyclopedic-technical information (distribution structure). All these are bound to be more complex in new hybrids rather than in conventional pure dictionary formats, particularly
if features such as pictorial illustrations, film and sound have to be added, or special pedagogical and legal requirements have to be incorporated for certain user groups. Experimenting with such structural components can benefit our better understanding of the underlying principles and potential innovation, but one risk of packing more and more mixed details into the dictionary may be information overload for the potential user, as illustrated by the kind of text compression that is typical of entries (like hybrid) in such dictionaries as the 2-volume NSOED (1993: 1285):

**hybrid** /ˈhaɪbrɪd/ n. & a. E17. [L. *hybrida*, (h)ybridus.] A n. 1 An animal or plant that is the offspring of individuals of different kinds (usually, different species). E17. 2 A person of mixed descent or mixed ancestry. Now usu. *derg*. M17. 3 A thing derived from heterogeneous sources or composed of incongruous elements; *Philol.* a word formed of elements from different languages; *Geol.* a hybrid rock. M19.

1. *Antony Huxley* showed man-made hybrids seen in florists' shops. 3. R. F. Hornon *A psychotherapist is a kind of hybrid . . . : a quasi-scientist, a quasi-artist.

B adj. 1 Of mixed character, heterogeneous; derived from unlike sources; (of a parliamentary bill) treated in some respects as a public bill and in others as a private one; (of a computer) employing both digital and analogue methods; (of rock) formed by the mixing of two magmas, or by the incorporation of solid rock into magma. E18. 2 Bred or produced as a hybrid.

L18. *Special collocations: hybrid* perpetual any rose of a group of formerly popular garden hybrids, derived in part from the Bourbon rose. *hybrid swarm* *Ecol.* a variable population resulting from the hybridization of neighbouring species. *hybrid sea* any rose of a group of hybrids now much grown, evolved from crosses between hybrid perpetuals and the tea-rose, *Rosa* × *centifolia*. *hybrid vigour* = *heterosis* 2.

**hybridism** n. (a) the fact or condition of being hybrid; (b) the production of hybrids. M19. *hybridist* n. a hybridizer. M19. *hybridity* = *hybridism* (b) M19.

The ultimate criterion for meeting a society's reference needs is successful dictionary use. The user perspective has indeed been the subject of detailed studies for the last two or three decades. However, work on the use of mixed dictionary types has been extremely limited. One exception to this has been Martin Stark (1999) who described a relatively new lexicographic hybrid, the encyclopedic learner's dictionary, and found that works such as the *LDELC*, the result of 'cross-breeding' of two other hybrids (the encyclopedic dictionary and the learner's dictionary), need more attention, both in terms of the factual information they offer and of the difficulties associated with their use.

The final branch of dictionary research is dictionary IT, or the way computers can assist us in compiling and consulting better reference works. Ever since Steven Dodd (1989: 91) asserted that "(a) computer database is almost infinitely extensible, and so there is more scope for the inclusion of extra material on any item", the use of information technology has been overwhelming, both as a means of obtaining information worldwide (there were 605 hits resulting from my Wanadoo-Google web-search for *Haydn* + *Theresienmesse*, and 48,762 for *hybrid* + *dictionary*, although I did not have the time to pursue them) and as a tool for making electronic reference works available to an ever greater range of users. As Yukio Tono (2004) has demonstrated, there is not only a multiplicity of formats (CD-ROM, Hyperlink, Pop-up mode, Parallel format, and Pocket e-dictionary), but also many combinations of dictionaries (such as hand-held calculator dictionaries for language learners) whose usefulness has yet to be tested.

4. SOME SPECIFIC EXEMPLARS

I present here a list of about two dozen hybrid dictionaries, based largely on those available to me at home, but there is only room in this paper for one example of each subtype. I try to give an impression of the whole range, good and bad, old and new, large and
small, common and rare, hardback and paperback. Disappointingly, fewer than 10% of
these are mentioned in the bibliography DDEE (Kabdebo & Armstrong 1997), paradox-ic
for a reference work that is itself a hybrid, priding itself of covering over 8,000 “dic-
tionaries, encyclopedias and other selected wordbooks in English”.

(1) Dictionary cum etymology

As Noel Osselton (2000) has pointed out, 'historical' dictionaries like the OED and its
derivatives, such as the so-called 'period dictionaries' for the various stages in the de-velopment of the language, have been prototypically hybrid products. But there are other
sub-types, such as the rather original FHRE, a 384-page account of the derivation of
English words from Indo-European and non-Indo-European languages, with (a) an in-
truction, (b) six sections listing word roots from various language families in alphabetical
order, plus three appendices: (c) language groups, (d) known and unknown roots, based
on reconstructed forms in Julius Pokorny's IEW (1959-69), and (e) bibliographical refer-
ences.

(2) Dictionary cum textbook

As we have seen above, Martin Stark (1999) was one of the first to state explicitly
that pedagogical dictionaries for foreign learners of English are combinations of ordinary
dictionaries with 'principles and practice of foreign language teaching'. MEDAL is such a
product, a 1,692-page book firmly in the tradition of the famous British EFL dictionaries,
but with several impressive innovations: (a) the front-matter includes a foreword by a
senior advisor, an introduction by the editor-in-chief, and a user-friendly set of instruc-
tions; (b) the middle-matter, interspersed in the alphabetical wordlist, has colour illus-
trations (e.g. for house, clothes and transport) and panels on language awareness (topics
such as phrasal verbs, academic writing, and word formation), and (c) the back-matter
contains the dictionary's defining vocabulary of 2,500 words, a list of usage labels, and a
pronunciation guide. The entries themselves are strengthened by information on frequency
rates, sense-discrimination menus, usage labelling (e.g. British vs. American English),
pictorial illustrations, sentence examples, and collocational information. (On encycloped-
lar learners' dictionaries, see No. 14; on electronic dictionaries, see No. 21 below.)

(3) Monolingual cum interlingual dictionary

Known variously as bilingualised dictionary, semi-bilingual dictionary, or bridge dic-
tionary in the context of English learner lexicography (such products based on A.S.
Hornby's dictionaries are examined by Carla Marello [1998] and Tom McArthur [2005]),
but as Gregory James (1994) has reminded us, translations of English dictionaries have
been around for centuries. The LLCE, a Chinese adaptation of the Longman Lexicon, is a
1,289-page learner's thesaurus, with Chinese translation equivalents of the thematically
grouped synonyms and examples, supported by pictorial illustrations, plus an English in-
dex. Special-purpose technical, encyclopedic and terminological dictionaries (see Nos. 6,
13 and 19 below) are also often subjected to translation, which is what happened when
the DL was published in a Japanese version in 2003.

(4) Dictionary cum grammar

The 314-page WPGSSD is part of the Trident mini dictionary library (see also under
Nos. 5 and 22 below) whose author and original publication details are not acknowl-
edged, but which offers a 'complete guide' in seven largely discursive sections devoted to (a) types of unspoken communication, (b) forms of spoken communication, (c) tools for effective written communication (including grammatical information such as *Wrong*: Mary took John to be I. *Right*: Mary took John to be me.), (d) writing academic assignments, essential letters and résumés (CVs), (e) an alphabetical list of foreign words and phrases, (f) proof-reader's marks and (g) a general index.²

(5) **Dictionary cum usage guide**

The *WPGSSD* is relevant also under this heading as it targets effective composition, although in the terms of the classical critique of 10 usage guides and 10 dictionaries by Thomas Creswell (1975) it is rather limited, vague and prescriptive. By contrast, the *VWBD*, a 954-page dictionary of German regionalisms (sub-titled *Die Standardsprache in Österreich, der Schweiz und Deutschland sowie in Liechtenstein, Luxemburg, Ostbelgien und Südtirol*) offers a comprehensive sociolinguistic documentation of cultural vocabulary from the various German-speaking territories in Central Europe. In a typical entry in the A-Z part, e.g. under *Matura*, there are regional labels (A for Austria, CH for Switzerland), grammatical details (no plural), alternatives (*Reifeprüfung* A D, *Matur* CH, *Abitur* D), definitions (‘-Prüfung bzw. Schulabschluss zur Erlangung der Hochschulreife’), corpus-based examples (*Thomas hätte im letzten Herbst die Matura bestanden, wolle aber nicht an die Hochschule*), Hostetter, Moira 10; CH), and cross-references (Berufsmatura, HAK-Matura, Maturaball, maturieren etc.). Regional variations of names, such as *Mitzi* for *Maria*, are also listed. The front-matter includes (a) a preface, (b) instructions for use, (c) contents of entries, (d) a definition of 'national' centres of German, (e) regional features of Standard German; the back-matter includes (f) a list of the text corpus and (g) bibliographical references.

(6) **Dictionary cum subject guide**

Most subject fields have their own dictionaries (sometimes called LSP dictionaries, short for 'languages for specific purposes'). Gardening experts have shown me several such hybrid guides, for identifying specific plants, for placing and treating specific plants, for locating plants in specific garden centres, and even for checking the pronunciation and etymology of specific plant names. What I have selected for exemplification here is *EL*, a 505-page guide to the 46 countries within and outside the European Union, in three sections: (a) survey articles on various historical, cultural, political and legal aspects of European integration, (b) details on individual countries, grouped under seven geographical regions, and (c) brief articles on European institutions grouped alphabetically, plus an appendix of chronological and bibliographical data and websites (but no maps). The country descriptions give the basic facts (name, size, capital, population etc.) and socioeconomic statistics (GNP, unemployment, foreign trade etc.). (See also Nos. 13, 19, 20 and 22 below.)

(7) **Dictionary cum onomastic information**

There are many different sub-types of dictionaries of personal and place names, overlapping with biographical and geographical reference works (see Nos. 8 and 9 be-

---
² Kaoru Akasu, co-editor of the bilingual *LEJD*, has drawn my attention to the fact that it was originally called *Union Dictionary* (first published in 1972), conceived as a combination of a dictionary and a grammar book.
low). An early example, first issued in 1894, is the CCN, sub-titled A Pronouncing and Etymological Dictionary of Names in Geography, Biography, Mythology, History, Ethnology, Art, Archaeology, Fiction, etc., etc., etc. (sic), a 1,085-page spin-off of the American 10-volume CDC edited by William D. Whitney (1889-95). It contains informative entries on both Joseph Haydn and Maria Theresa (or Theresia) (sic), each with dates and achievements, and cross-references to other entries in the alphabetical list (from the river Aa to the town Zwolle).

(8) Dictionary cum biographical information

The DBPP is a 641-page biographical dictionary "containing the Chief Events in the Lives of Eminent Persons of All Ages and Nations, preceded by the Biographies and Genealogies of the Chief Representatives of the Royal Houses of the World" in a single alphabetical sequence, with introductory essays and family trees illustrating the descent of rulers in 34 countries. I was not disappointed when I looked up F.J. Haydn (although he is described as German) and Maria Theresia (although she is called Maria Theresa) as well as the lexicographers Samuel Johnson, Noah Webster, John Ogilvie, the Grimm brothers and Emile Littré.

(9) Dictionary cum atlas

Atlases are another genre neglected in dictionary research. Occasionally one is surprised by unusual combinations, although after a few consultations they seem to make good sense. The GA, e.g., consists of (a) an introduction, (b) a calendar of gardening events, (c) 146 pages of maps of different parts of Britain, in order of counties, (d) a 62-page gazetteer, and (e) an index. (Note that the term 'atlas' is used in a different sense in the DTV-Atlas series; see No. 22 below).

(10) Dictionary cum lifestyle book

YMG is a 96-page handbook, part of a series of Information/Activities/Reference guidelines on such topics as 'eating well', 'having a baby' and 'indoor plants', consisting of (a) a table of contents, (b) brief discursive sections on the nature, origin and types of yoga, (c) descriptions of activities and positions, (d) plans for beginners' and more advanced programmes, (e) a list of postures (in alphabetical order of their Sanskrit names, with diagrammatic drawings), (f) a glossary of health terms, (g) a book list, (h) a list of courses and useful addresses, (i) a glossary of yoga terms, (j) an index, and (k) credits for photographs and contributing experts.

(11) Dictionary cum catalogue

Catalogues vary by subject and type of product listed, using a wide range of reference structures (thematic and/or alphabetic, title and/or author name, etc.). The REDCDC contains in the 1,244 pages of its 18th edition (revisions are no longer published) the following components: (a) an introduction, (b) a 'main section' listing CDs of pop music in alphabetical order of artists, (c) a similar list of 'compilations', (d) 'soundtracks' and (e) 'collections', plus (f) a short list of 'composer collections'. Most entries carry information on the respective artist/composer ('black strip' heading), the title of the recording, its tracks, the product number, release date and record label.
(12) **Dictionary cum calendar**

One of the prototypes modelled on the internationally renowned (Stein) *Kulturfahrplan* is the *CMW*, a chronologically arranged list, first published in 1966, of (a) important events (displayed on the left-hand pages) and (b) achievements in the arts and sciences, politics and sport (grouped under 12 subject-headings on the right-hand pages), with a total of 709 pages, followed by a 310-page index of subjects and personalities.

(13) **Dictionary cum encyclopedia**

We have already seen (cf. Collison, Kafker, McArthur, Spree) that the tradition of the encyclopedic dictionary is strong for many countries and languages. My own favourite in this genre is the *RDGID*, a two-volume alphabetic dictionary with a total of 1,920 pages and information on words and etymologies, things and ideas, places and personalities, using a clear layout of two text columns and a narrower marginal column in which coloured illustrations, maps and the pronunciation key are located. Some topics of general interest, e.g. *alphabet*, *brain*, *Impressionists*, *playing cards*, *sea-life*, *stringed instruments*, and *train*, are treated in larger panels.

(14) **Pedagogical dictionary cum encyclopedia**

The encyclopedic learner's dictionary described in Stark (1999) can be exemplified by *LDELC*, a reference work consisting of 31 pages of front-matter, 1,528 pages of alphabetically arranged entries, and 27 pages of back-matter. The front-matter includes (a) grammar codes, (b) pronunciation table, (c) contents list, (d) preface, (e) explanatory chart and (f) user's guide, the back-matter has information on (g) numbers, (h) weights and measures, (i) military ranks, (j) word formation, (k) defining vocabulary, (l) irregular verbs, and (m) short forms and labels. The 80,000 entries (including 15,000 on encyclopedically and culturally significant words) in the A-Z part are supplemented by 804 illustrations, 16 encyclopedic 'features', 405 cultural 'notes' and several large and small maps.

(15) **Dictionary cum literature guide**

*BGRG*, a 310-page guide to recurring literary themes, consists of alphabetically arranged articles on specific authors (from Douglas Adams to Émile Zola) with 'reading skeins' to books of similar topics (e.g. from Jane Austen's 'social comedy' *Pride and Prejudice* to William Thackeray's *Vanity Fair*), interspersed with 'menus' of suggested reading (from Action Thrillers to Weepies), plus an author and title index.

(16) **Dictionary cum film guide**

One of my favourite reference works is the *HFVG*, an annually revised annotated listing of most films and videos in alphabetical order of their titles. Its 18th edition has 991 pages, with (a) an introduction, (b) the A-Z guide, and appendices of (c) Academy Award winners, (d) four-star films (by title and year), (e) three-star films (by title and year), and (f) an index of leading directors. Each entry contains publicity tags, ratings (from none to four stars), country of origin, year of release, production details, a one-sentence synopsis of the plot, a brief assessment, and credits to director, cast and other staff, occasionally with quotes from critics and additional notes. Logos used, e.g. for type of product, points of interest and Academy Award details, are explained at the bottom of every page.
(17) Dictionary cum travel guide

The most well-known example of this sub-genre is the 'phrase book', and one of its representatives is the *EPB*, sub-titled "All the phrases you need to make yourself understood in 14 European languages . . .", with a total of 318 pages containing a preface and a 'reference section' in addition to the language sections which are uniformly subdivided into: guide to pronunciation, the alphabet, greetings, questions, basic words and expressions considered useful for specific communicative situations (such as money, travel, accommodation, food and drinks, services, etc.).

(18) Dictionary cum thesaurus

As Werner Hüllen's two books (1999, 2004) have shown, the early tradition of English dictionaries was 'topical', i.e. based on the thematic arrangement of lexical and factual information, and the pioneering approach in Roget's *Thesaurus* was to group synonymous words and phrases into notional classes and divisions. Until recently, combinations of alphabetic and thematic word-lists have been rare (Franz Josef Hausmann [1990] discusses the French example of the so-called 'analogical dictionary'). However, when Nicoletta Calzolari (1988) suggested that it is relatively easy with the means of IT to combine the two formats of the alphabetic dictionary and the systematic thesaurus, several dictionary-thesauruses have become available for English, such as the *CDT*, which consists of 8 pages of front-matter (foreword, guide to the text, abbreviations used) and 63 pages of back-matter (guide to writing, including letters and CV) in addition to the 856-page A-Z list, with each page divided into two parts, (i) traditional dictionary information at the top and (ii) information on synonyms at the bottom, although they do not always match well, perhaps because they are based on different products previously issued by the publisher. Thus, the top two thirds of p. 717 consist of entries from *soapstone* to *soft*, and the bottom one third of thesaurus entries from *soar* to *sodden* (which means that the 'T' reference from within the entry on *sofa* to synonyms of that word in the thesaurus part requires a move forward to the subsequent page, which contains thesaurus entries for the words *sofa* to *solid*).

(19) Dictionary cum terminology

Within the very long tradition of the terminological dictionary, Manuel Alvar Ezquerra (1992) singles out the 4-volume *DC* (1786-93) for its coverage of general and technical vocabulary not only of Spanish, but also of their equivalents in French, Latin and Italian. Others, such as Fred Riggs (1989), stress the differences between lexicography as a 'semasiological task' (from word to meaning) and terminography as an 'onomasiological operation' (from meaning to word) rather than their similarity, i.e. the codification of LSP terms. In practice, they vary considerably in purpose and coverage, often without respecting the distinction between lexical dictionary and terminological glossary, with or without definitions, with or without equivalents in other languages. In the National Meteorological Library and Archive of the Met Office in Exeter I found the 335-page *MG*, consisting of (a) a foreword by the editor of the 6th edition, (b) a preface by the Met Office, (c) a list of symbols used, (d) the alphabetical list of articles with discursive explanations of the technical terms of meteorology, and (e) a bibliography.
Many dictionaries contain pictorial illustrations, which have been discussed by Werner Hupka (1989) in terms of art and technology, design and effectiveness. The OVD, developed in Canada, provides on its 959 pages clear and lively drawings in colour which illustrate multifarious objects arranged under 28 conceptual headings, from Astronomy and Geography to Weapons and Symbols, together with the associated vocabulary in English, French and Spanish, plus appropriate indexes. Music is treated between the sections entitled Office Automation and Creative Leisure Activities, starting with a page depicting 'traditional instruments' such as zither, lyre, balalaika, mandolin and banjo, but the guitar (acoustic as well as electric) does not appear until 11 pages later, at the end of the 'stringed instruments', although without taking into account recent developments, e.g. in 'jazz' and 'western' models.

Various electronic reference works, sometimes called 'interactive', are now available which synthesise dictionary information with other details, adding new features and formats which, however, have not been subjected to systematic investigation (cf. Hartmann 2001: 67 on new 'access structures'). The HMME is such a hybrid which, once installed via CD on my computer, allowed me to consult difficult words, survey its 39,000 articles, pursue biographies, such as those of Haydn and Maria Theresa (sic), and where necessary follow up additional clues to relevant events, portraits and other pictorial illustrations, quotations and sources, country facts, web links, and the like, enjoying the ease of coloured cross-references between articles, e.g. musical instruments related to the guitar. There has been a trend in countries where IT is dominant, such as Japan, for suppliers of hand-held calculators to combine a range of related (and sometimes unrelated) dictionaries from different publishers for specific user groups, such as language students and businessmen. Sales are impressive3, but there is little feedback available on which of these hybrids are used for which purposes.

There is a tradition, e.g. by the German publisher of the famous Duden, to market related dictionaries as a home or office 'library' (see also Nos. 4 and 5 above). Nowadays, with the support of IT, it has become relatively easy for publishers to group complementary dictionaries together, under such titles as 'reference set' and 'reference shelf' (see No. 21 above, including Footnote 2). The German DTV-Atlas series provides information on specific subjects, not in the form of textbooks or terminological glossaries, but by a combination of thematically arranged text (on the right-hand page) and explanatory tables and diagrammatic illustrations in colour (on the left-hand page). The term 'atlas' has become accepted for this format, although it can be misleading to the uninitiated (see No. 9 above). In the historical part of the double volume on music, the 591-page DTVAM, I found Haydn's Theresienmesse (and the name Maria Theresia) as well as some of the musical hybrids, such as Tango and Flamenco (but not Kolo).

3 Shigeru Yamada (personal communication, 27/06/05) has sent me a list of over 80 dictionary titles in various combinations produced by Casio, Seiko and Sharp for Japanese, English and other languages, covering such subjects as spelling and synonymy, travel, business, health, history, computer terms, and literature.
(23) Dictionary cum magazine

For a more unusual hybrid we turn to *HH*, a cross between a catalogue and a periodical. Its latest 119-page edition is sub-titled *The Toy and Model Making Annual* and includes illustrations, descriptions, order codes and prices for (a) doll's houses, (b) castles, farms and garages, (c) wheeled toys, (d) novelty projects, (e) ships, boats and accessories, (f) craft kits and books, (g) tools and materials, (h) archives (fretwork designs and models), (i) end-of-line sale items, and (j) an index.

(24) Dictionary cum concordance

At the intersection between reference works and literature lies the so-called 'author's dictionary', described by Olga Karpova (2003) as a concordance or glossary of the vocabulary used in a writer's single text or complete works. More than 300 monolingual and bilingual dictionaries are now available for English authors since Geoffrey Chaucer, notably Marvin Spevack's *ST* (1993).

(25) Dictionary cum novel

Finally, the union of lexicography and literature has also produced a rather unexpected offspring, the 'dictionary novel'. I know of at least three members of this new family, by Andreas Okopenko (1970/1983) in German, Milorad Pavić (1983/1988) in Serbo-Croatian, and Han Shaogong (1996/2003) in Chinese, the latter two being available in English translation. Han's 323-page book is a moving biographical account in the form of 110 discursive dictionary articles (together with a preface, information on pinyin transliteration and list of entries, an afterword, glossary and list of characters) describing the experiences of a young urban intellectual who was sent to the country to do agricultural work during the Cultural Revolution. It is characterised by Jennifer Eagleton (2005: 65) as follows: "Hang Shaogong, by subverting both the 'normal' narrative structure of fiction and the 'authoritative' nature of reference works, firmly opposes set guidelines or dogma on thinking, art and literature."

5. IMPLICATIONS

This paper has probably raised more issues than it could settle. Several questions remain open, such as: Is the multi-purpose dictionary an incomplete hybrid rather than a 'general dictionary'? Do we have a full account of all the various specialised exemplars? What do we know about their users? Does IT allow all possible combinations, and how should they be developed? What are the (commercial/scholarly/technological) limits to lexicographic hybridisation?

In the end, I managed to find answers to most of my questions raised in the introduction, by consulting some of the dictionaries surveyed here, except perhaps the one about why Haydn had dedicated this particular mass to Maria Theresa. The programme notes (another mixed-media publication) of the choir concert attempted a partial explanation: the name day of the wife of the emperor, and her commission for another work performed a year later, the *Te Deum*, but I am not sure whether I will ever be able to ascertain all the relevant facts...
Cited dictionaries and other reference works:


HII = HOBIES HANDBOOK. Hobbies, Dereham, Norfolk 2005


IEW = INDOGERMANISCHES ETYMOLOGISCHES WÖRTERBUCH comp. Julius Pokorny. Francke, Bern 1959-69


ST = A SHAKESPEARE THESAURUS comp. Marvin Spevack. G. Olms, Hildesheim 1993

Other literature:


---------------- (2005) "The first learner's dictionary: the Chinese dimension", The Hong Kong Linguist 25, pp. 21-26


ČISTI ILI KOMBINOVANI?
RAZVOJ MEŠOVITIH VRSTA REČNIKA

Rajnhard R. K. Hartman

Ovaj rad se bavi "hibridnim" vrstama rečnika i drugih priručnika. Nasuprot tradiciji u kojoj opšti rečnici postaju usko specijalizovani, javlja se tendencija kombinovanja dve ili više vrsta "čistih" tipova rečnika posebne namene, npr. kombinovanje alfabetskog i tematskog rečnika, opštog rečnika i tehničkog rečnika, rečnika i tezaurusa, rečnika i enciklopedije, jednojezičnog i dvojezičnog rečnika, i sl. Razmatraju se primjeri različitih podvrsta (s obzirom da je nauka o rečnicima zanemarila njihovo izučavanje), u cilju određivanja opštih tendencija i implikacija, naročito u vezi sa njihovim mogućim daljim razvojem uz pomoć informacione tehnologije.

Ključne reči: Leksiografija, istorija rečnika, tipologija rečnika, kritika rečnika, struktura rečnika, upotreba rečnika, hibridne vrste, (elektronski) priručnici.